

1

2 CITY COUNCIL

3 CITY OF NEW YORK

4 -----x  
THE TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

5 of the

6 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

(Held Jointly With)

7 SELECT COMMITTEE ON LOWER MANHATTAN  
REDEVELOPMENT

8 -----x

9 March 7, 2002  
Start: 1:30 p.m.  
10 Recess: 4:43 p.m.

11 City Hall  
Council Chambers  
12 New York, New York

13 B E F O R E:

14 JOHN C. LIU  
Chairperson, Committee on Transportation

15 ALAN GERSON,  
16 Chairperson, Select Committee on  
Lower Manhattan Redevelopment

17 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Angel Rodriguez  
18 Eva Moskowitz  
Diana Reyna  
19 James Sanders  
Helen Sears  
20 Andrew Lanza  
Margarita Lopez  
21 Bill Perkins  
Yvette Clarke  
22 Melinda Katz  
David Yassky  
23 Martin Golden

24 LEGAL-EASE COURT REPORTING SERVICES, INC.  
217 Broadway - Suite 511  
25 New York, New York 10007  
(800) 756-3410

1

## 2 A P P E A R A N C E S

3

Iris Weinshall  
Commissioner  
NYC Department of Transportation

5

Andrew Salkin  
Borough Commissioner for Lower Manhattan  
NYC Department of Transportation

7

Tony Cracchiollo  
Port Authority

9

Seth Kaye  
Executive Vice President for Transportation  
Economic Development Corporation

10

11 Sandy Hornick  
Deputy Executive Director  
12 NYC Department of City Planning

13 Carol Clark  
Director of Governmental Affairs  
14 NYC Department of City Planning

15 Richard Muller  
Office of Manhattan Borough President  
16 C. Virginia Fields

17 Robert Gottheim  
Brooklyn District Director  
18 Transportation Policy Analyst  
Office of Congressman Jerrold Nadler  
19 8th District, New York

20 Jeffrey Zupan  
Senior Fellow for Transportation  
21 Regional Plan Association

22 Jill Oberlander  
General Counsel  
23 Alliance for Downtown New York, Inc.

24 Noah Budnick  
Projects Director  
25 Transportation Alternatives

1

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

3

Carter Craft  
4 Program Director  
Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance

5

Lisa A. Schreibman  
6 NYC Coordinator  
Tri-State Transportation Campaign

7

Brendan Sexton  
8 The Durst Organization, New York Water Taxi

9

Patrick Harris  
Atlantic Sail Charter

10

George Haikalis  
11 Auto-Free NY

12

Katherine Brower  
Transportation Planner  
13 Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA

14

Jimmy Willis  
Transport Workers Union, Local 100

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 CHAIRPERSON LIU: I want to get this  
3 hearing going, and I want to welcome everybody to  
4 today's joint hearing of the City Council's  
5 Committee on Transportation, and the Select  
6 Committee on Lower Manhattan Redevelopment.

7 My name is John Liu, I am the Chair  
8 of the Transportation Committee.

9 The purpose of this Committee hearing  
10 is to explore opportunities to reconstruct the  
11 transportation infrastructure that was destroyed in  
12 September 11th terrorist attack in a way that would  
13 provide the greatest benefit to the people of the  
14 City of New York, and to the entire metropolitan  
15 area.

16 I would like to thank my colleague  
17 Alan Gerson, Chair of the Select Committee on Lower  
18 Manhattan Redevelopment, for agreeing to this joint  
19 hearing, and I look forward to continuing and  
20 expanding on the productive working relationship  
21 that we all have.

22 I would like to also introduce my  
23 colleagues who have joined us, colleagues from the  
24 Committee, as well as other members of the Council.

25 Starting from my right we have

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Council Member David Yassky from Brooklyn; Council  
3 Member Bill Perkins from Manhattan; and James  
4 Sanders, Council Member from Queens. My co-chair  
5 today, Alan Gerson. We have Helen Sears, Council  
6 member from Queens; Andrew Lanza, Council Member  
7 from Staten Island; Yvette Clarke, Council member  
8 from Brooklyn; and Melinda Katz, Council member from  
9 Queens; and up in front we have Margarita Lopez,  
10 Council Member from Manhattan. Thanks for  
11 participating today.

12                   Before I proceed to the substance of  
13 this hearing, I would like to share my personal  
14 remorse and sadness at what happened on September  
15 11th. The events of that day had enormous adverse  
16 consequences on innumerable lives and businesses,  
17 and to them I extend, on behalf of these committees  
18 and the Council, condolences and best wishes for  
19 future prosperity and safety. I also want to extend  
20 my condolences to the families of the victims.

21                   The tragedy of September 11th has  
22 left us with an unprecedented opportunity to rebuild  
23 the Transportation infrastructure in Lower  
24 Manhattan, in a manner that better serves to reflect  
25 upon 21st century needs of residents and businesses

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 than what have previously existed.

3                   In place of the pre-existing  
4 hodge-podge of transportation facilities, which  
5 often allowed passengers to make their transfers and  
6 connections only with great difficulty, the  
7 opportunity now exists to develop an integrated  
8 multi-modal facility which would include bus,  
9 subway, commuter rail and ferry lines.

10                   Such a facility has the potential to  
11 connect all existing transportation services in the  
12 World Trade Center area to each other, making it far  
13 more practical and convenient for riders to  
14 seamlessly make transfers to other lines or other  
15 modes of transportation.

16                   One such plan reportedly put forth by  
17 the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, in  
18 concert with the Metropolitan Transportation  
19 Authority, has been highly publicized and harbors  
20 significant positive potential.

21                   We look forward to hearing about the  
22 details and progress of this plan and other plans,  
23 from representatives of both agencies, as well as  
24 other agencies and planners, including the New York  
25 City Department of Transportation.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   An integrated multi-modal facility at  
3 the World Trade Center site carries with it two  
4 pivotal advantages. First, the facilities that have  
5 been proposed thus far have all been located  
6 exclusively underground. This would take heavy  
7 pedestrian traffic off of the streets and would  
8 allow for maximum flexibility for surface  
9 reconstruction of residences and businesses.

10                  Second, any transportation mega hub  
11 built in Lower Manhattan would almost certainly be  
12 accompanied by substantial economic development.  
13 History has shown that economic development follows  
14 wherever transportation infrastructure is built out.

15                  We have every reason to believe that  
16 the creation of a transit mega hub would greatly  
17 enhance access to jobs, as well as business  
18 opportunities.

19                  Building a large, logical and easily  
20 navigable underground transportation facility in  
21 Lower Manhattan would not only serve to retain  
22 businesses and residences already established in  
23 Lower Manhattan, but would also attract new ones.

24                  This facility should be versatile  
25 enough for commuters from all five boroughs, as well

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 as Long Island, Westchester and New Jersey to use.

3                   The goal should be to provide the  
4 best and most convenient service to as many people  
5 as possible.

6                   I'm just really excited about this  
7 opportunity. We have the potential to make it easier  
8 for people to get to Lower Manhattan, get to and  
9 from Lower Manhattan, and also make it easier for,  
10 say, people in Brooklyn and Queens to get to New  
11 Jersey and vice-versa. It's really got the potential  
12 to be a regional powerhouse, in terms of transit and  
13 transportation.

14                   Let me thank everyone in advance who  
15 is to appear today in our hearing on this issue,  
16 which is so vital to the future of the City of New  
17 York. In particular, I wish to extend a gracious  
18 welcome to representatives of government agencies  
19 and transportation planners. I want to thank you for  
20 taking your time out to share with us your views and  
21 your plans.

22                   And at this time I would like to call  
23 upon the first couple of witnesses to appear before  
24 us, and to please ask you to come to the table up  
25 here.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   We have Commissioner Iris Weinshall  
3 from the Department of Transportation.

4                   Let me step back a little bit and ask  
5 my colleague, Chairman Alan Gerson of the Select  
6 Committee.

7                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Thank you, Mr.  
8 Chair. I'll be brief in order to get underway and in  
9 order to conserve my voice for the discussion and  
10 questioning to follow, but I would be remiss, Mr.  
11 Chair, if on behalf of my community and my Committee  
12 I did not acknowledge and thank you, sir, for the  
13 work you have done in organizing this hearing and  
14 for your leadership to our City on transportation  
15 matters, and I look forward to working with you in  
16 the days ahead.

17                   I just want to underscore your point  
18 that New York historically was built upon its  
19 transportation network from our origins as a  
20 transport entranceway to the rest of the then new  
21 world, to a more recent development where  
22 neighborhoods sprung up along the lines of our  
23 subway tracks.

24                   Lower Manhattan will be rebuilt in  
25 large part by the vitality and the vibrancy and the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 efficacy of its transportation network.

3                   I would just add, as we begin this  
4 process today, Mr. Chair, we keep in mind the  
5 duality of the challenge, as you have pointed out we  
6 need to assure a transportation hub, an integrated  
7 intermodal, as you have stated, transportation hub,  
8 would serve the entire region. We also need to  
9 remember that Lower Manhattan is a vibrant  
10 residential community and we need to provide  
11 transportation support so residents who live there  
12 in those communities, as well as in the surrounding  
13 communities of our City can get around Lower  
14 Manhattan and can connect to the rest of the City.

15                   We also need to keep in mind when we  
16 talk about transportation, we talk about transit  
17 modality and efficiency, but we also talk about the  
18 great environmental challenge. Even before 9/11  
19 Lower Manhattan was suffocating from a crisis of  
20 diesel particulate in our air, from the inordinate  
21 amount of vehicles that spewed diesel into our  
22 areas. We must have a public transportation system  
23 that provides the transportation and also alleviates  
24 that environmental crisis as we move ahead.

25                   And, so, with that I look forward to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 this morning's hearing and to the ongoing work. I

3 thank you very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Chairman

5 Gerson.

6 We are pleased to have the honorable

7 Iris Weinshall, Commissioner of Transportation, for

8 the City of New York.

9 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Good

10 afternoon. I want to thank Chairman Gerson and

11 Chairman Liu for inviting me here today to speak

12 about transportation issues in Lower Manhattan.

13 With me today is Andrew Salkin, the

14 newly appointed DOT Borough Commissioner for Lower

15 Manhattan.

16 As you well know, September 11th

17 struck a massive blow to the transportation and

18 utility infrastructure networks in Lower Manhattan.

19 The subway lines, the path, major roads and critical

20 utility lines were all knocked out of service. Some

21 for just a few days or weeks, others for months and

22 years to come.

23 Now there is an opportunity, unwanted

24 as it may be, to create a new transportation and

25 infrastructure network that serves the residents,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 businesses and visitors to Lower Manhattan.

3                   As the City agency charged with  
4 ensuring the safe and efficient movement of  
5 vehicular and pedestrian traffic movement, the  
6 Department of Transportation has played a role in  
7 the short-term recovery and will play a role in the  
8 future development of Lower Manhattan.

9                   Today I want to address to the  
10 Committee on the impact of the attacks, and what DOT  
11 has done and plans to do to help Lower Manhattan  
12 recover and ultimately rebuild.

13                   After the attacks, Con Edison  
14 facilities were destroyed, temporarily depriving  
15 over 13,000 customers of service.

16                   A critical Verizon building at 140  
17 West Street was severely damaged, causing 700,000  
18 telephone customers initially to lose service and  
19 leaving many with spotty service that continues  
20 today for some.

21                   The water and sewer system along the  
22 perimeter of the World Trade Center on Church Street  
23 was lost.

24                   Critical transportation  
25 infrastructure could not be operated, in some cases,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 on a short-term basis, such as the N and R downtown  
3 subway stops, and a portion of our traffic signal  
4 system, and in other cases for much longer, such as  
5 the PATH station and the southern portion of 1 and 9  
6 subway service.

7                   The surface of nearly 100 blocks were  
8 extensively damaged or destroyed.

9                   Over the past six months, DOT has  
10 taken a series of emergency response measures to  
11 help the City recover, including instituting an SOV  
12 Ban, adding new ferry service to Lower Manhattan,  
13 temporarily rerouting buses and working with the  
14 State to ensure that West Street reopens as soon as  
15 possible - and incidentally, I would like to point  
16 out that West Street is slated to open in early  
17 April which will allow for the reopening of the  
18 Brooklyn Battery Tunnel.

19                   Replacing the lost infrastructure,  
20 though, will be a massive undertaking. Restoring the  
21 electric, gas, steam, telephone, subway, PATH,  
22 sewer, water and cable service, translates into  
23 hundreds of street diverted cuts in Lower Manhattan.  
24 The closure of key arteries like 9A and Church  
25 Street diverted traffic onto smaller side streets,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 which were never intended for such heavy usage.

3 Clearly, the streets of Lower Manhattan are taking a  
4 beating - the City needs to ensure the integrity of  
5 streets once the work is completed.

6 Working the Department of Design and  
7 Construction, we are developing a roadway  
8 restoration plan that addresses these concerns. We  
9 have inspected all of the various streets and are  
10 coordinating with the utility companies, the PATH  
11 and the MTA. Our restoration plan includes nearly  
12 600 blocks in Lower Manhattan.

13 All of the street construction will  
14 impact the flow of traffic and pedestrians  
15 throughout Lower Manhattan. DOT is responsible for  
16 overseeing that work and mitigating these impacts.  
17 Because of the massive amount of work facing Lower  
18 Manhattan, coordinating it effectively is a top  
19 priority.

20 To this end, Mayor Bloomberg  
21 appointed DOT's first Lower Manhattan Borough  
22 Commissioner Andrew Salkin. His office is  
23 responsible for managing the street work,  
24 maintaining safe and efficient traffic and  
25 pedestrian flow, and working with the many

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 stakeholders in Lower Manhattan.

3                   Further, DOT has taken a leadership  
4 role in developing effective working relationships  
5 with the region's transportation and economic  
6 development partners, including various City and  
7 State agencies from New York and New Jersey, and the  
8 Port Authority, the MTA, the Downtown Alliance, and  
9 the utility companies.

10                   Since September 11th we have been  
11 meeting together on a weekly basis, meetings which  
12 are led by DOT to discuss transportation and  
13 infrastructure recovery issues related to Lower  
14 Manhattan.

15                   Those meetings are both an important  
16 way to coordinate activities, and also a symbol of  
17 the spirit of cooperation amongst agencies that has  
18 been developed over the past six months.

19                   An example of our new partnership has  
20 been the working group on ferries spearheaded by  
21 Deputy Mayor Dan Doctoroff.

22                   Under his leadership, DOT, EDC, the  
23 Port Authority, and the Empire State Development  
24 Corporation are developing a plan to significantly  
25 enhance commuter ferry service in Lower Manhattan.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Of course, this is in addition to  
3 ferry service DOT has been operating since September  
4 17th, the Brooklyn Ferry from Sunset Park to Lower  
5 Manhattan.

6                   Initially intended as a temporary  
7 replacement for the N and R subway lines, DOT uses  
8 boats from our Staten Island ferry operation.

9                   It has become a popular and  
10 invaluable service for Brooklyn commuters and DOT  
11 plans on maintaining it as long as possible.

12                   We are looking into contracting out  
13 the service to make it more affordable and to get  
14 our boats back to the Staten Island ferry operation.  
15 We hope that the funding of these plans will come in  
16 large part from our federal partners, FEMA, the  
17 Federal Transit Administration, and the Federal  
18 Highway Administration.

19                   For the past six months, DOT's  
20 mission has been to work with our regional partners  
21 and come up with innovative ways to help the City  
22 recover. Now, as we move into a rebuilding phase  
23 with the reconstruction of the PATH and the MTA  
24 station, and the return of thousands of workers to  
25 Lower Manhattan, and the redevelopment of the World

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Trade Center site, DOT will maintain what spirit of  
3 cooperation and creative problem solving.

4                   We have a tremendous opportunity  
5 here, a clean slate to work with.

6                   Accordingly, DOT will push the  
7 discussion forward towards some innovative ideas.  
8 The possibilities include improvements that some  
9 transportation planners and advocates have dreamed  
10 about for years:

11                   - creating a downtown transit hub  
12 that would link the east side subway service, the  
13 west side subway service, and the reconstruction  
14 PATH station.

15                   - increasing utilization of waterway  
16 transport to ensure that commuters from all parts of  
17 the region can reach Lower Manhattan easily.

18                   - making improvements to the downtown  
19 streetscape to make it safer and more aesthetically  
20 pleasing.

21                   - and perhaps even burying the lower  
22 portion of West Street and opening up as a  
23 greenspace or development.

24                   In six months we've taken steps to  
25 help the area rebuild. I am hopeful that six years

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 from now we will have created an accessible  
3 revitalized and vibrant Lower Manhattan, and I  
4 certainly look forward to working with your  
5 committees as we strive to make that happen.

6 Thank you for your time, and I'm glad  
7 to take any questions now.

8 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Council members, do  
9 we have any questions for the Commissioner?

10 Council Member Yassky.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Welcome,  
12 Commissioner. It's good to see you again.

13 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: It's good to  
14 see you, David.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: I just have  
16 two comments. I guess one is, you know, I applaud,  
17 and we have discussed this in the past, the  
18 Administration's focus on ferry transportation as an  
19 alternative to traditional mass transit, and I  
20 understand that your working group has been actively  
21 pursuing ways to increase and enhance ferry  
22 transportation. I would say, though, just my  
23 suggestion is that look not only to New Jersey and  
24 to the existing ferry routes and figuring out what  
25 can be done to increase utilization of those, but

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 that you also explore ways of increasing ferry  
3 transportation within the five boroughs.

4 I think that there is a tremendous  
5 untapped market of workers for Lower Manhattan in  
6 parts of Queens and Brooklyn that are much more  
7 accessible, could be more accessible by ferry  
8 service than they are by existing mass transit. So,  
9 when you refer to the Brooklyn ferry, my hope is  
10 that that will be a Brooklyn ferry before too long.

11 My second suggestion, I guess, is  
12 that as you think about developing this downtown  
13 hub, which is visionary, that the commuter, or a  
14 reinstated commuter tax, could be one way of  
15 financing the need transportation improvements.

16 I mean, I believe that our partners  
17 in the suburbs will be all the more willing to chip  
18 in to keep New York going as the engine of the  
19 economy that it is for things like transportation  
20 improvements that they directly benefit from.

21 So, I just put that out on the table  
22 as something that I think the administration ought  
23 to consider as they present a full package.

24 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Thank you.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Yassky.

4 Council Member Lopez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Thank you for  
6 coming today to see us.

7 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: My pleasure.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Your  
9 Administration decided to remove a transportation  
10 facility that we have between the two districts of  
11 Council Member Gerson and myself during the big  
12 period of the tragedy, which is a bus that goes all  
13 the way back and forth through Madison. That bus  
14 has not been put back to go all the way to the end  
15 and come back.

16 The residents of Vladdick Houses, of  
17 the co-ops, and the residents of some of the  
18 Mitchell-Lama housing that is at the end of that  
19 route are suffering the consequences of this. Are  
20 you planning to restate that bus in place?

21 If you are, when? And if you are not,  
22 why not? We need it.

23 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, the bus  
24 is run by the MTA, not by DOT. There may be a reason  
25 why they temporarily ceased that bus route. It could

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 be because of the limited access on St. James Place.  
3 I'm not familiar with the route, so I can't really  
4 answer it.

5 I don't know if the MTA, Chairman  
6 Liu, is testifying today, but if they are I would  
7 suggest you offer the question to them. But DOT, it  
8 must be an MTA route, and we don't operate that bus  
9 route.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: The reason I am  
11 asking you is because the explanation that was given  
12 to the community was that the streets were closed,  
13 but the streets are open now. There is no reason  
14 why, unless you have a problem with these buses  
15 going back and forth based on the streets itself?

16 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: I'll be happy  
17 to talk to Katie Lapp, who is the new Executive  
18 Director of the MTA. I know some of the streets are  
19 still closed in Lower Manhattan, particularly the  
20 ones around Police Plaza, and, again, you'll have to  
21 excuse me, I don't know the route well enough. It  
22 could be the reason why they haven't reinstated  
23 that route.

24 Also, as you know, St. James is a  
25 rather crowded street now as you come off the FDR

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Drive, that may be a reason, but I'll be happy to  
3 talk to Katie Lapp and figure out why the bus route  
4 has not been reinstated.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: I thank you.  
6 And, I mean, if the problem is the problem with the  
7 street, we need to alleviate this problem because,  
8 as you know, that's the only transportation facility  
9 we have down there.

10 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Sure.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: We don't have  
12 subways.

13 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Sure.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Therefore,  
15 without this, we have nothing.

16 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: We'll be  
17 happy to look into it.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
20 Member Lopez.

21 My co-chair, Council Member Alan  
22 Gerson.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Thank you,  
24 Commissioner. And thank you, first, for your  
25 Department's work in the very difficult days, your

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 and your Department's work --

3 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Thank you.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: In the very  
5 difficult days following the tragedy. Our community  
6 recognizes and appreciates that.

7 Let me add a note of congratulations  
8 to the Mayor and to you for the wisdom in appointing  
9 Mr. Salkin as our first Commissioner of  
10 Transportation for Lower Manhattan, and that being  
11 said, I look forward to meeting with you on a  
12 regular basis, and working very closely with you.

13 Just a couple of questions on the  
14 broader vision.

15 As Council Member Lopez pointed out,  
16 the bus service she mentioned is the only service in  
17 that area, one of the reasons being the lack of  
18 progress on the Second Avenue subway. So, I'm  
19 curious if you have any thoughts on the broader  
20 scale as to whether or not getting the Second Avenue  
21 subway going and connecting it to Lower Manhattan  
22 has an important role to play in the future  
23 transportation center of downtown?

24 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well,  
25 clearly, I mean there's been numerous discussion

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 about the Second Avenue Subway and clearly more  
3 subway service is needed on the East Side of  
4 Manhattan. To be honest with you, I mean this is a  
5 rather herculean task to get the Second Avenue  
6 subway off the ground.

7                   I think one of the areas that the  
8 Mayor has asked my agency to look at is the area of  
9 using more rapid bus transportation in Manhattan,  
10 and I think that over the next few months, DOT  
11 working with MTA as a partner, will be taking a  
12 closer look. I believe the term is used "bus rapid  
13 transit," and I think that that's an area that we  
14 will be looking at to enhance more mass transit  
15 opportunities to people, particularly in the City of  
16 New York. But clearly the Second Avenue subway has  
17 been on the wishlist for quite a long time for the  
18 City, and I think still a lot of work needs to be  
19 done, in terms of both securing the financing and  
20 securing the ultimate route for that subway.

21                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Well, if it,  
22 in fact, relates to the need to revitalize the  
23 overall transportation structure, I would think  
24 that's a good case and reason for going to the  
25 federal government for them to kick in their fair

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 share for the Second Avenue subway or part thereof,  
3 in addition to the other transit improvements.

4 I also wanted to ask your thoughts on  
5 connections to the commuter railway lines that serve  
6 our City.

7 From time to time there has been talk  
8 of in one way or another fashioning a connection to  
9 Lower Manhattan, to Metro North or LIRR, either  
10 directly or indirectly through, for instance, a  
11 Second Avenue subway in from Queens or through a  
12 transfer to a ferry or any other number of ways, and  
13 I'm curious, again, if you have any thoughts on the  
14 role that connection might play in the future  
15 transportation hub?

16 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: I think  
17 you're correct. I mean, there are a lot of proposals  
18 floating out there regarding connecting those  
19 commuter lines to Lower Manhattan.

20 One of the ideas that is most  
21 appealing to New York City DOT, and Chairman Liu  
22 touched on it in his statement, was the fact that we  
23 have so many different subway lines coming into  
24 Lower Manhattan, and clearly they don't make sense,  
25 in terms of connecting those subway lines, and it

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 caused a lot of people, particularly pedestrians, to  
3 have to walk above ground, as opposed to walking  
4 below ground.

5                   We at DOT believe that we have been  
6 given an opportunity here now to rethink a hub in  
7 Lower Manhattan, in terms of connecting all those  
8 lines.

9                   If it should come to pass that the  
10 commuter lines and the MTA have the resources  
11 available to think about extending those commuter  
12 lines, we think it would just make it that much more  
13 attractive for businesses both to stay in Lower  
14 Manhattan and to actually relocate here.

15                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: And, finally,  
16 I would just comment, I would hope in your last  
17 bullet point you would drop the "perhaps" in  
18 reference to burying the lower portion of West  
19 Street. I would commend that as a fine addition to  
20 the future of Lower Manhattan, and as you coordinate  
21 the ground construction work, keep in mind that the  
22 residents of Lower Manhattan still need to get a  
23 good night sleep.

24                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, as for  
25 that point, we do appreciate that, and I would just

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 hope that you would stress to your constituents that  
3 there is a tremendous amount of work to be done down  
4 here, and we are cognizant of the fact that there  
5 are tens of thousands of people who live down in  
6 Lower Manhattan, and we'd like to see Lower  
7 Manhattan remain a 24/7 community.

8 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
9 Member Gerson.

10 We have Council Member Sanders.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Thank you,  
12 Mr. Chair.

13 Good afternoon, Commissioner.

14 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Good  
15 afternoon.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: And  
17 congratulations.

18 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: As an outer  
20 borough person, I, too, favor the idea of ferry  
21 service, and I want to encourage the working group  
22 on ferries to continue to work, because I think we  
23 can really make our City work in the 21st century if  
24 we use one of the biggest resources around us, the  
25 water.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   You had mentioned a transportation  
3 hub in your conversation; will a hub accommodate a  
4 ferry slip, a commuter railroad, the subway access,  
5 pedestrian movers, and still be underground?

6                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, I think  
7 that the concept that is being spoken about by some  
8 of the planners that are involved, DOT is just one  
9 partner in this endeavor, is just what you spoke  
10 about. I mean, the whole concept is it would connect  
11 all the subway lines down here, as well as using  
12 people movers to move people from one subway line to  
13 another.

14                   I think the goal is also, you talk  
15 about ferry service, it's very important to  
16 understand that a lot of the ferry service in  
17 Manhattan currently now leaves people off where  
18 there is no further transportation. So, we have to  
19 start to think about, is ferry service truly going  
20 to be a multi-modal form of transportation, and how  
21 do we provide that service once people are left off  
22 at a ferry slip?

23                   Clearly, if we were to think about  
24 opening up the street scape of Lower Manhattan yet  
25 again to the way it was before the World Trade

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Center buildings were located there, that would give  
3 us an opportunity to have people walk, or go  
4 underground, to be able to get from the ferry slips  
5 in Battery Park City to further east in Manhattan.  
6 So, those are very exciting ideas for us at DOT, and  
7 we'll be working with the other partners in  
8 transportation to explore them.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Thank you,  
10 Mr. Chair.

11 Thank you, Commissioner.

12 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you.

13 We have Council Member Katz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Commissioner, I  
15 thank you for being here as well today. I think that  
16 sometimes you don't truly appreciate the extra work  
17 and time that this tragedy has brought onto every  
18 City agency and every elected official, and we thank  
19 you for being here.

20 And before we go to my question, I  
21 want to echo what Councilman Sanders said. As  
22 someone who worked in Queens Borough Hall for three  
23 years myself, and now in the Land Use Committee we  
24 have the issues of the waterways that keep coming up  
25 time and time again, especially Councilman Sanders

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 and Councilman Yassky, as well, we would like to  
3 talk about ferry service much more and alleviating  
4 the traffic, especially in terms as a Queens Council  
5 Member I can say from Queens, as well, I like to  
6 call them the other boroughs. So, in the other  
7 boroughs besides Manhattan, as well. We'll do that  
8 at a future time.

9 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Absolutely.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: But my question  
11 really is, there's been a lot of discussions,  
12 obviously in the last few days, especially because  
13 of the Mayor's announcement of 7 World Trade Center,  
14 and of course the economic development plan of the  
15 entire area and the Land Use plan of the entire  
16 area, that's on the one hand, and then on the other  
17 hand, as Chairman Liu said, this is an opportunity  
18 for us, you know, it's a tragic opportunity, but it  
19 is an opportunity to truly make the transportation  
20 from Lower Manhattan accessible to everyone, and I  
21 think that what your agency has proven is that we  
22 can do it and we can look into a lot of different  
23 options.

24 But my concern is really, for want of  
25 a better terminology, who is driving the train? The

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Lower Manhattan Development Corporation is obviously  
3 working very hard with many of the Council members  
4 and the Mayor, and that's another issue, in coming  
5 up with an economic plan for down there, but on the  
6 other hand, the transportation issues; can you  
7 develop a true transportation plan without knowing  
8 exactly ultimately what the agencies are going to be  
9 doing for Lower Manhattan.

10 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, I think  
11 that the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation has  
12 been very welcoming in terms of asking for input  
13 from various groups, retail, residential,  
14 commercial, and a transportation subcommittee was  
15 recently formed, advisory committee, and they had  
16 their first meeting this past week.

17 I believe that what the Mayor and  
18 Governor are trying to do is to try and get as much  
19 input as possible, in terms of various ideas, and  
20 then at some later date present those ideas, both to  
21 the public and the Empire State Development  
22 Corporation and the Lower Manhattan Development  
23 Corporation.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Ideas on  
25 transportation?

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: On  
3 transportation. I mean, each of the various  
4 subcommittees or advisory groups are all developing  
5 different ideas that I believe will be part of a  
6 plan that will be announced by the Mayor and  
7 Governor regarding Lower Manhattan, and  
8 transportation, as was announced yesterday by the  
9 Mayor and Governor, played an extremely important  
10 role in terms of redeveloping Lower Manhattan.

11 I have to tell you that both the MTA  
12 and the Port Authority have been very forthcoming  
13 and very collegial with the other transportation  
14 agencies, in terms of sharing their ideas and their  
15 visions for Lower Manhattan.

16 The Port Authority was in just a few  
17 weeks ago, they shared the concept of how they're  
18 going to get the path opened and where the exit and  
19 entrance points will be. We met last week with the  
20 TA to discuss the construction that they've begun on  
21 the 1 and 9, and, again, extending the South Ferry  
22 Train Station.

23 So, these are all ideas that are  
24 really coming to the forefront, and I believe that  
25 more will be heard in the future about

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 transportation ideas.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: And you've been  
4 intricately involved in all those issues?

5 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Absolutely.  
6 All of the groups. And as I mentioned in my  
7 testimony, we have a weekly meeting, probably  
8 unheard of in the past, of all the transportation  
9 players, and not only are the day-to-day issues,  
10 which Andrew Salkin has to deal with, are mentioned  
11 at those meetings, but all of the future plans are  
12 discussed as well.

13 I think we all realize since  
14 September 11th, that we're all integral players and  
15 that not one of us can step in the limelight alone  
16 and espouse an idea. It has an impact on what we all  
17 do down in Lower Manhattan.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: So, your sense  
19 is we're going hand-in-hand together down the same  
20 road, and we'll figure out the issues together, both  
21 on transportation and the overall plan of the area?

22 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Absolutely.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
25 Member Katz.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Let me just quickly say that the next  
3 person that we will be hearing testimony from is  
4 from the Port Authority, and, so, we may get more  
5 information about the particular plan for the hub at  
6 that point, so I just want to point out to my  
7 colleagues that we'll hear more about the actual  
8 plans, or some of the plans, that are being thought  
9 of.

10                   We have a question from Council  
11 Member Reyna.

12                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you, Mr.  
13 Chair.

14                   I just wanted to congratulate our  
15 Commissioner for staying on board with the  
16 Administration, and I wanted to take an opportunity  
17 to understand exactly how this particular  
18 redevelopment is going to take place, as far as  
19 funding, a timeframe, any designs? How far in  
20 advance are we with what you have just presented to  
21 us?

22                   Because it's nice to mention that  
23 this is something we want to work on, but are we  
24 really thinking about the consequences? We all know  
25 we're in a critical time right now, and there are

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 major city cuts; how will this time frame affect  
3 these plans? And will it be doable during this time?

4 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, as for  
5 the streetscape work that DOT and DDC is responsible  
6 for, there is federal funding available under the  
7 Federal Highway Administration.

8 We have presented our plan for the  
9 streetscape, and the rebuilding of the streets and  
10 the roads in Lower Manhattan.

11 I believe approximately \$130 million  
12 will be available from the federal government to  
13 rebuild the streets and the roads in Lower  
14 Manhattan. That's the work that DOT and DDC is on  
15 the direct line responsible for.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: You are  
17 mentioning that in addition to the ferry service  
18 that you've mentioned here are partnered in funding  
19 by FEMA through the Federal Transit Administration  
20 and Federal Highway Administration?

21 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: The ferry  
22 service is outside of that \$130 million. There's  
23 just \$130 million allocated for all the street work  
24 that will need to be done.

25 You can imagine, when that

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 unfortunate day happened and those buildings came  
3 rumbling down, the impact it had on the  
4 infrastructure in terms of our roads. So, many of  
5 the roads in Lower Manhattan will have to be  
6 rebuilt.

7                   As for the ferry services, Councilman  
8 Golden knows, and he's been extremely helpful to the  
9 agency, in terms of working with FEMA and working  
10 with the Congressional Delegation, we have been very  
11 fortunate that FEMA has said that they will fund the  
12 Brooklyn ferry service, in light of the fact that we  
13 have lost the 1 and 9 service that we have limited  
14 access to our roads. So, although we haven't gotten  
15 a firm number yet as to the exact dollar amount,  
16 FEMA has made a commitment that they will be funding  
17 that Brooklyn ferry service.

18                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Despite the  
19 fact that we don't have any dollar amount, do we  
20 know for how long we're able to have that free ferry  
21 service?

22                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, we  
23 haven't gotten a definitive answer yet. There are  
24 various states that have been floated by FEMA, some  
25 of the dates are as short as March, some of them go

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 as far as June and July. For now FEMA has not told  
3 us to pull the plug, so we are continuing to operate  
4 the ferry, and we are confident that that funding  
5 will be available at the end of the term.

6                   What that term is I can't tell you  
7 right now, because FEMA hasn't told us.

8                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Is there a plan  
9 B?

10                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, the  
11 Councilman was very gracious, he hosted a town hall  
12 meeting in his neighborhood just to talk about the  
13 ferry service a couple of weeks ago. I have to tell  
14 you that those who take the ferry, not only get up  
15 early in the morning to take the ferry, but they  
16 come out late at night for town hall meetings, which  
17 was very heartening to see.

18                   There are a lot of different options  
19 available to us and many of the Councilman's  
20 constituents even went so far as to say that they  
21 were prepared to pay for a swipe of the MetroCard to  
22 continue to take the ferry, and some of them even  
23 went as far as to say they would be willing to pay  
24 the cost of what an express bus costs. I thought  
25 that was very gracious and generous of the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Councilman's constituents. So, we have lots of  
3 different options available.

4                   You know, I would like to say that,  
5 you know, many of the Council people have talked  
6 about ferry service, and it was very --

7                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I'd like to go  
8 on record as one of them. Thank you.

9                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, it was  
10 very, really heart-warming to hear the many positive  
11 tales about the ferry service that we created in  
12 Brooklyn, and, so, we would clearly like to explore  
13 the option of providing ferry service from other  
14 parts of the City.

15                   It clearly is a way of getting people  
16 off the roads, and onto a much quicker, more  
17 efficient way of getting into Manhattan.

18                   I often say about the ferry service,  
19 it's back to the future. I think as all the  
20 Councilpeople know, ferry service in the 1800s and  
21 the early 1900s was one of the principle ways that  
22 people got into Manhattan from the other boroughs,  
23 so it's an area that we'd like to explore in the  
24 future.

25                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you very

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 much, Commissioner.

3 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much,  
4 Council Member Reyna.

5 We have Council Member --

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: I just want to  
7 say, Council Member Golden, we want to thank your  
8 district for agreeing to fund and make up the  
9 deficits that our City faces.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: I would love  
11 to thank this Committee, but most of all thank the  
12 Commissioner for her great job and her efforts in  
13 staying on top of that issue and bringing waterborne  
14 transportation to a reality. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Council Member  
16 Martin Golden from Brooklyn, who has joined us.

17 We have Council Member Perkins.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you  
19 very much, Mr. Chairman.

20 And, Commissioner, thank you for your  
21 testimony, and congratulations, as well, for your  
22 new appointment.

23 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Two quick  
25 questions.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Your vision is grand and wonderful,  
3 and especially as it inspires in me the realization  
4 of the economic opportunities, the employment  
5 opportunities, the contracting opportunities that it  
6 entails, and I'm wondering about your thoughts for  
7 some sort of preferential treatment with regard to  
8 New Yorkers in that regard, as a way of, you know,  
9 stimulating our economy, helping our people get back  
10 on their feet, particularly the contracting  
11 opportunities and the training opportunities  
12 relating to some of that work that will be, and, of  
13 course, any preferential treatment with affirmative  
14 action goes a long way as well; do you have any  
15 thoughts on that?

16                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, I mean,  
17 clearly, as you talk about it, Councilman, these are  
18 very large infrastructure projects. Many of them the  
19 City will not be the lead agency, they will be  
20 either the MTA or the Port Authority.

21                   Clearly, for the streetscape work in  
22 Lower Manhattan it will be DDC working in  
23 conjunction with DOT, and, of course, we will follow  
24 whatever procurement rules are in place for the City  
25 of New York.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   But you clearly set out that there  
3 will be tremendous employment opportunities for all  
4 people in the City of New York, and that in itself  
5 will hopefully be an economic stimulus for the City.

6                   COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: You know,  
7 especially considering a displaced -- you know, that  
8 have lost their work.

9                   Another pet concern of mine that you  
10 raise in your testimony, is about the construction  
11 that will take place, particularly, as you know,  
12 rats and construction, you dig up the ground, out  
13 come the rats, and I'm just wondering, you know,  
14 have you been thinking in that vain in terms of  
15 abatement and other kinds of controls that are  
16 necessary?

17                   COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, we will  
18 continue to work with the Department of Health,  
19 which monitors that program for the City of New  
20 York, and you're absolutely right, where we dig up  
21 large trenches, we tend to get various types of rats  
22 and other things come to the surface, and we will  
23 continue to work with the Department of Health to  
24 monitor those incidences.

25                   COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 very much, I appreciate it.

3 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much,  
4 Council Member Perkins.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Just a quick  
6 follow-up of five seconds. I join my colleagues as a  
7 proponent, as an avid proponent of the expansion of  
8 ferry services. I just strongly ask and request that  
9 in determining the locations of particular, of  
10 specific ferry terminals, you consult with and work  
11 with the communities where they are going to be  
12 sited.

13 Obviously, in extending ferry  
14 service, we don't want to inflict noise or other  
15 problems on the inland communities, and I'm  
16 confident enough space exists to find the right  
17 location, so I think we need to work together to  
18 achieve that.

19 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, in that  
20 vain, DOT has worked very closely with the Port  
21 Authority. As you know, we have now numerous ferry  
22 slips in the City of New York, and I might point out  
23 that after September 11th, we felt the need to  
24 create another ferry slip on the west side, you  
25 know, that we opened up Pier A, and I have to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 applaud the Port Authority, within a matter of  
3 weeks, and I think with very little disruption to  
4 the community around, they were able to dredge the  
5 area and to really create a very efficient workable  
6 ferry slip that has become an integral part of the  
7 ferry service now in Lower Manhattan.

8                   So, I hear what you're saying, and if  
9 we plan any new ferry slips in the future we will  
10 definitely consult with the community.

11                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you.

12                   We have been joined by Council Member  
13 Angel Rodriguez, from Brooklyn.

14                   We have one last question from  
15 Council Member Yvette Clarke.

16                   COUNCIL MEMBER CLARKE: Good  
17 afternoon, Commissioner, and I echo the sentiments  
18 of my colleagues in congratulating you. You have a  
19 mammoth task ahead of you, but given your years of  
20 experience with transportation, we know that the  
21 concerns of our citizens are in good hands.

22                   Having said that, I've been thinking  
23 a little bit out of the box, and because you're a  
24 woman, but in addition to that, I have just been  
25 thinking, because the effect of Lower Manhattan has



1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 of what we can do in terms of transportation,

3 Commissioner.

4 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: Well, I think

5 you're correct about the park-n-ride aspect. As

6 Councilman Golden knows, at the Brooklyn ferry we

7 have space, the ferry slip is actually constructed

8 by EDC, and they had the foresight to put in parking

9 spaces for 500 vehicles, and we find that many

10 people not only come from that part of Brooklyn, but

11 they come from the Rockaways and from Long Island to

12 drive there and then they take the ferry into

13 Manhattan. So, I think you're absolutely right.

14 As for bicycle pads, I might point

15 out that the DOT is working very closely with a lot

16 of communities in terms of extending and creating

17 more bike paths, both around the City and into the

18 City, and once we finish with the reconstruction of

19 our three East River bridges, it will be that much

20 easier for people to bicycle into the City. So,

21 you're absolutely right about those two issues.

22 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you,

23 Commissioner. Thank you, Council member.

24 At this time I'd like to invite the

25 next panel of speakers to come up. Once again, thank

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 you, Commissioner Weinshall, for your time.

3 COMMISSIONER WEINSHALL: My pleasure.

4 CHAIRPERSON LIU: We have Tony  
5 Cracchiollo, from the Port Authority; Seth Kaye from  
6 the Economic Development Corporation, and Sandy  
7 Hornick and Carol Clark, from the Department of City  
8 Planning. Hopefully we can get enough chairs up  
9 there.

10 Thank you, gentlemen, and ladies. I  
11 would like to invite Tony Cracchiollo to give us  
12 their testimony.

13 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: Good afternoon,  
14 Chairman Liu, Chairman Gerson, and Council members,  
15 and thank you for the opportunity to speak to you  
16 today regarding the restoration of PATH Service to  
17 Lower Manhattan. I will be speaking about both our  
18 plans to restore the temporary service to Manhattan  
19 as quickly as we can, as well as some of our  
20 preliminary thinking and planning about how to  
21 improve transportation downtown vis-a-vis PATH and  
22 the subway system.

23 First, let me talk a little bit about  
24 the temporary PATH service.

25 It's absolutely critical for Lower

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Manhattan, that we return PATH service to Lower  
3 Manhattan as quickly as possible. The Port Authority  
4 recognized that very shortly after September 11th,  
5 and has been working ever since to try to accomplish  
6 that.

7                   We also, before I start talking  
8 specifically about the PATH station downtown, let me  
9 talk a little bit about some of the restoration that  
10 needs to occur on PATH.

11                   As you may or may not know, shortly  
12 after September 11th the tunnels under the Hudson  
13 River, which divide service into Manhattan, were  
14 flooded, and they remained flooded for about six  
15 weeks.

16                   We plugged those tunnels on the New  
17 Jersey side to prevent the water from entering the  
18 remainder of the system, and as you may know, the  
19 uptown PATH service provided a tremendous -- took a  
20 tremendous increase in the number of passengers that  
21 used it after September 11th for people that were  
22 trying to get downtown by transferring to subways  
23 from Ninth Street and Christopher Street and 14th  
24 Street, as well as for some of the businesses that  
25 relocated temporarily into Midtown. So, protecting

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 that Uptown service was critical to us when we  
3 plugged those tunnels.

4                   We now need to restore those tunnels  
5 under the Hudson River. We need to completely remove  
6 -- all those systems in those tunnels were severely  
7 damaged and need to be replaced, and there's two  
8 miles of tunnel under the River.

9                   We also closed our Exchange Place  
10 station in Jersey City, and that is of interest to  
11 Manhattanites and residents of New York City because  
12 as well as having almost 65,000 people coming to New  
13 York into Lower Manhattan every day at the World  
14 Trade Center PATH station prior to September 11th,  
15 we also had a significant reverse flow, close to  
16 9,000 or 10,000 people a day, who went to jobs in  
17 New Jersey using the PATH system. So, restoring that  
18 service to Exchange Place is also critical for us  
19 and we are in the process of doing that.

20                   On December 13th, 2001, the Port  
21 Authority's Board of Commissioners and the Governor  
22 authorized the expenditure of up to \$544 million to  
23 re-establish PATH service to Lower Manhattan.

24                   In February, the Port Authority  
25 retained the contractor for this effort, a

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 triventure partnership of Yonkers Contracting, Tully  
3 and A.J. Pegno Contracting, and we're targeting the  
4 restoration of Path Service to Exchange Place by  
5 June, hopefully prior to June of 2003, and to Lower  
6 Manhattan and hopefully prior to this date by the  
7 end of 2003, December of 2003.

8 I will illustrate just using one  
9 diagram what that PATH Service would be, but before  
10 I do that, let me just explain, in order to get PATH  
11 Service back as quickly as possible, we decided very  
12 quickly to utilize the existing plans that existed  
13 prior to September 11th and to put the PATH Station  
14 back essentially as it existed on September 10th, in  
15 the existing location in the World Trade Center  
16 bathtub, with the entrances on -- we're creating a  
17 temporary entrance on Church Street between Dey and  
18 Cortlandt Street.

19 Bill, if I can just show that?

20 I'm not sure everyone can see that.  
21 We'll turn it around. But essentially what you're  
22 seeing in the orange color is the vicinity of Church  
23 Street, just west of Church Street. We will create  
24 an entrance at that point, which will be utilized by  
25 the PATH, temporary entrance for PATH.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   We also have the ability, we're  
3 working very closely with the MTA and New York City  
4 Transit to potentially utilize those entrances and  
5 make a connection at that location between PATH and  
6 the N and R subway line, which existed prior to  
7 September 11th, and also to the East subway line in  
8 the World Trade Center terminal station, just north  
9 there on Vesey Street.

10                   So, that is our plan to restore the  
11 temporary PATH service and to get it back as quickly  
12 as possible. I should say that to do that we will  
13 not be putting back exactly the station that  
14 existed, we will have a bare bones station  
15 essentially, with very minimal finishes in the  
16 station, and weather protection but not fully heated  
17 and air conditioned. However, we'll provide the same  
18 level of service, in terms of the number of  
19 passengers it can handle safely, and complying with  
20 all ADA requirements, as we had on September 10th.

21                   So, that is our plan and we are  
22 working literally around the clock to achieve it.

23                   Now, if I can spend a couple of  
24 minutes and talk about what you've heard already  
25 Commissioner Weinshall speak about, and the Chairman

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 alluded to in his opening remarks, we have been  
3 working with the MTA and with New York City Transit  
4 to develop a concept, and I will call it a concept  
5 at this point, for what a long-term PATH station  
6 would be in Lower Manhattan, and how can we make it  
7 work better with the subway lines and the other  
8 transportation modes downtown, and we're at a very  
9 preliminary stage of that. We have something, we  
10 have a concept that we've been sharing with many of  
11 the stakeholders in Lower Manhattan, the City and  
12 State agencies, transportation entities and  
13 commercial and real estate communities and others,  
14 to get their input as to whether this idea is  
15 something that we should pursue and take to the next  
16 step. So, let me take that opportunity to share that  
17 with you.

18                   I think, as Commissioner Weinshall  
19 alluded to, subways in Manhattan, in Lower  
20 Manhattan, essentially arrive in a north/south  
21 direction, there is very little opportunity to  
22 connect between those subways in an east/west  
23 direction, or for that matter to connect to PATH in  
24 an east/west direction, or for that matter for  
25 pedestrians to get east crosstown, if you will,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 other than by using the above-ground streets which  
3 are very crowded.

4                   So, we obviously looked at a way to  
5 do that, and now that we have an opportunity to do  
6 that, we felt that this is something that could be  
7 done as part of the redevelopment of a permanent  
8 PATH station, and I'll show you those plans in  
9 detail. But essentially our corridor, as you can see  
10 on this map, would extend from the World Financial  
11 Center on the west over to at least Broadway on the  
12 East, connecting all the subway lines and the new  
13 PATH station and the development, the future  
14 development that occurs, including the future  
15 memorial that would be developed on the World Trade  
16 Center site, so it would connect all of those  
17 facilities and allow easy transfers for people  
18 between the subways and PATH, and the ferry line,  
19 which also exists, the ferry terminal which we are  
20 building in a permanent mode on the Hudson River at  
21 the World Financial Center.

22                   In a little larger scale, what you  
23 see, again, it's hard to pick out in detail, but on  
24 the left side of that map is West Street and the  
25 World Financial Center, and on the east side is

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 where you see that last gray line going north and  
3 south is Broadway, and the 4 and 5 subway line which  
4 is under Broadway, and the A and C, which goes east  
5 from that point.

6                   We will propose to create an  
7 underground corridor, a very wide corridor with  
8 moving walkways, potentially, that would connect  
9 with escalators and elevators to redevelop subway  
10 stations all the way from the 4 and 5, connecting to  
11 the N and R to the C and E at Church Street to the 1  
12 and 9 as it's reconstructed in the World Trade  
13 Center site, to the PATH, and we have a potential to  
14 locate the PATH from the existing location, or to  
15 move the PATH station over closer to Church Street  
16 where it existed prior to the World Trade Center  
17 being built in 1971, in the old Hudson Manhattan  
18 terminal space. You see that indicated on this plan.

19                   However, in either location that path  
20 would be reconstructed as a permanent station, it  
21 would work with this intermodal corridor, and you  
22 see an indication on this map of two squares, yellow  
23 squares, in the World Trade Center site, and those  
24 are just indicative of some kind of vertical  
25 circulation or connection that would occur to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 whatever development is built above the site in the  
3 future, and where those locations would be and what  
4 they would be would depend on that development,  
5 which corridor is flexible enough to allow  
6 connections anywhere on that site.

7                   Also, that corridor would go under  
8 West Street, including, we believe it has the  
9 capability, should West Street be depressed, as  
10 Commissioner Weinshall noted, we could still connect  
11 below West Street or above West Street, whatever  
12 makes the most sense, depending on what that plan  
13 looks like, and using the Bay Street corridor, which  
14 this is now contemplating, it would connect directly  
15 under Bay Street to the Wintergarden, direct  
16 connection to the Wintergarden, which provides an  
17 ideal location for that connection to occur.

18                   So, that is the plan and concept, and  
19 I'll show you a cross section which might make it a  
20 little clearer.

21                   Again, an underground corridor, very  
22 wide, I might say, corridor, hopefully with the  
23 ability to bring in natural light so that it's not a  
24 depressing environment and not an unsafe  
25 environment, and the ability to bring in natural

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 light, the potential ability in the future to  
3 relocate, retail developments along that corridor, a  
4 major transportation hub at Church Street, whether  
5 or not our PATH station is there, and the potential  
6 for a transportation hub at Broadway and Fulton  
7 Street, and this is depending on the MTA being able  
8 to proceed with that part of the project.

9                   But it has the potential capability  
10 to create a major transportation hub downtown, unite  
11 all those independent subway services with PATH,  
12 with the ferries and potentially with other modes of  
13 transportation in the future.

14                   So, that is essentially our concept  
15 as we develop it to date. The Port Authority has  
16 initiated dialogue regarding this transportation  
17 plan, with many of the agencies and organizations  
18 with roles in the redevelopment of Lower Manhattan,  
19 including, of course, the Lower Manhattan  
20 Development Corporation, the major agencies,  
21 including the MTA, the City, State DOTs, and we look  
22 forward to continuing that dialogue, including with  
23 the City Council members here, and with the guidance  
24 with the Governor and the Mayor and the Council and  
25 other players in the redevelopment of Lower

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Manhattan. The Port Authority hopes to have a more  
3 definitive plan, be able to take this plan or some  
4 version of this plan to further development and to  
5 have something further to present, hopefully, by the  
6 end of the year.

7 Thank you, again, for the opportunity  
8 to speak today.

9 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Mr.  
10 Cracchiollo.

11 We have a quick question from Council  
12 Member Lopez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: You said that  
14 this temporary plan is in compliance with the ADA  
15 law?

16 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: That's correct.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Can you be more  
18 specific what you mean by that? Sometimes compliance  
19 with ADA laws are very funny concepts, and if you  
20 can expand on that, that would be helpful.

21 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: Yes.

22 First of all, our platform will be  
23 fully compliant, which is, you know, distances  
24 between our train doors and platforms. We will have  
25 elevator connecting all the levels to get down from

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 street level to each of the platforms. There  
3 potentially will be three platforms as existed prior  
4 to September 11th. So, there will either be ramps or  
5 elevators for handicap access. Our signage will be  
6 all ADA compliant, as required by ADA regulations,  
7 and our train platforms and doors will be all  
8 compliant.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: And you're  
10 going to expand this after the temporary structure  
11 is eliminated, then the permanent structure will be  
12 also fully accessible?

13 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: Absolutely.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Connecting also  
15 to the other ones that you were talking about?

16 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: That is our  
17 proposal. You know, we have to again work with our  
18 partners at the MTA. I can't speak for all the  
19 subway stations, I would hope that that would be the  
20 case. But the MTA would have to address each of  
21 their subway stations specifically.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LOPEZ: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LIU: We have Seth Kaye  
24 from the Economic Development Corporation.

25 Thank you for coming.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 MR. KAYE: Good afternoon. Thank you,  
3 Chairman Liu, Chairman Gerson. Thank you for  
4 inviting New York City Economic Development  
5 Corporation to present testimony on opportunities to  
6 reconstruct the transportation infrastructure around  
7 the former World Trade Center site in an integrated  
8 multi-modal manner for the benefit of the entire  
9 metropolitan region.

10 My name is Seth Kaye, I serve as the  
11 Executive Vice President for Transportation at EDC.

12 Prior to September 11th, 2001, over  
13 375,000 workers and tens of thousands of visitors  
14 entered Lower Manhattan every day. More than 90  
15 percent of these people used mass transit to get the  
16 jobs and other activities at various sites in the  
17 area.

18 While Lower Manhattan as a diverse  
19 array of transit options, including subways, buses  
20 and ferries, travel has long been difficult to Lower  
21 Manhattan for several reasons.

22 These include the lack of convenient  
23 and direct connections for regional commuters who  
24 enter the City at facilities such as Grand Central  
25 terminal, Pennsylvania station, and the Port

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Authority bus terminal; the inadequate connections  
3 between downtown New York City Transit subway lines  
4 and the PATH system; subway platform and train  
5 crowding; and the density of the intricate and  
6 chronically congested roadway network in Lower  
7 Manhattan.

8                   To adequately address solutions for  
9 improving transportation connections to Lower  
10 Manhattan, it is important to consider the source of  
11 trips into the area. The vast majority of trips come  
12 from origins within New York City, Manhattan, as  
13 well as the other boroughs, so improvement  
14 strategies must focus on the needs of these  
15 commuters.

16                   The next largest group constitutes  
17 New Jersey commuters who have been particularly  
18 inconvenienced by the loss of PATH service.

19                   Finally, measures must be addressed  
20 to solve the long-standing access problems of  
21 commuters from Long Island and the Hudson Valley.

22                   Many governmental and  
23 non-governmental groups have presented sound  
24 proposals for improving Lower Manhattan  
25 transportation in the aftermath of the September

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 11th terror attacks.

3                   From these various reports the  
4 consensus is hopefully emerging for a phased  
5 improvement program that combined short, medium and  
6 long-term initiatives.

7                   These hold the potential for both  
8 immediate relief and eventually permanent solutions  
9 to the area's chronic transportation problems.

10                   EDC has been working closely with the  
11 New York City Departments of Transportation and City  
12 Planning, the Empire State Development Corporation,  
13 and the Port Authority since September 11th to  
14 enhance ferry service to Lower Manhattan.

15                   These initiatives include the new  
16 ferry landing at Pier A, the expansion of landings  
17 at Pier 11, and future improvements at the World  
18 Financial Center ferry landing.

19                   Ferry service has been critical in  
20 starting the recovery process for businesses in  
21 Lower Manhattan who have continued to be a critical  
22 means for providing access during the time it takes  
23 to restore the PATH service.

24                   In the longer term, the initiatives  
25 now underway will serve as a catalyst for increased

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 service and new routes along the East River Long  
3 Island Sound corridor, the Hudson River and Lower  
4 New York Harbor, offering great promise for future  
5 ferry services to Lower Manhattan for many points  
6 within New York City and the metropolitan region.

7                   There have been various proposals, as  
8 you just heard, for rebuilding the PATH station  
9 under the former World Trade Center site, with  
10 connections to the New York City Transit subway  
11 complex, including the Fulton Street and Broadway,  
12 Nassau stations.

13                   The concept offers tremendous  
14 potential for improving access to Lower Manhattan,  
15 as well enhancing the ability of people to move  
16 around and within the Financial District.

17                   While the focus is on the  
18 construction of such facility, attention should also  
19 be devoted to better integration of regional transit  
20 systems through the universal acceptance of the  
21 single fare card medium. Such a measure is essential  
22 as proposals are advanced for major expansions to  
23 the subway and regional rail networks.

24                   In closing, I want to thank the  
25 Committee on Transportation and the Select Committee

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 on Lower Manhattan Redevelopment for holding this  
3 hearing to highlight the important role that improve  
4 transportation infrastructure will play in restoring  
5 Lower Manhattan as an attractive place to work and  
6 live, and for the promise it offers in maintaining  
7 the economic viability of New York City and the  
8 region.

9 Thank you, again.

10 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you for your  
11 comments.

12 We're going to take questions after  
13 the next speaker, and then after that we're going to  
14 take a short three-minute break before we reconvene.

15 We have Sandy Hornick and Carol Clark  
16 from the Department of City Planning.

17 MR. HORNICK: Chairman Liu, Chairman  
18 Gerson, Committee members, good afternoon. My name  
19 is Sandy Hornick, I'm Deputy Executive Director for  
20 Strategic Planning at the Department of City  
21 Planning, and I'm here with Carol Clark, our  
22 Director of Governmental Affairs, and we appreciate  
23 this opportunity to speak with you this afternoon  
24 about the important transportation issues and  
25 opportunities associated with rebuilding Lower

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Manhattan.

3 I'd like to take this opportunity to  
4 thank the Port Authority, the MTA, EDC, DOT and  
5 other agencies for quickly restoring mobility under  
6 some of the most difficult circumstances in the  
7 City's history, and in particular, and I attended  
8 many of those meetings that Commissioner Weinshall  
9 mentioned, thank Commissioner Weinshall for  
10 coordinating the efforts of the agencies of the  
11 City, two states and the federal government in this  
12 complex effort. As a career civil servant, it was  
13 quite a site to see.

14 Placing today's concerns in  
15 historical perspective illuminates a number of  
16 long-term issues, particularly the transportation  
17 issues facing Lower Manhattan. With 117 million  
18 square feet of commercial space south of Chambers  
19 Street prior to September 11th, Lower Manhattan was  
20 the second most important office center after  
21 Midtown and the nation's third largest after Midtown  
22 and Chicago, the position it continues to hold  
23 today.

24 Nevertheless, Lower Manhattan, New  
25 York's original business district, and once the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 nation's largest, has been losing its competitive  
3 edge to Midtown since Pennsylvania and Grand Central  
4 Stations were built early in the last century.

5                   Lower Manhattan has suffered more  
6 from the inevitable business cycles because repeated  
7 revival efforts, while successful, have not  
8 addressed the area's underlying weaknesses.

9                   Midtown, with superior transportation  
10 access and a newer building stock, surpassed Lower  
11 Manhattan in importance after World War II.

12                   By the early 1960s a public private  
13 partnership spearheaded by David Rockefeller was  
14 needed to reverse Lower Manhattan's fortunes.

15                   Lower Manhattan experienced another  
16 downturn relative to Midtown in the late 1980s, as a  
17 result of the 1987 stock market crash, and declines  
18 in key sectors, such as banking and insurance, but  
19 once again exacerbated by Lower Manhattan's  
20 relatively poor transportation access, and  
21 relatively antiquated office building stock.

22                   Lower Manhattan's last decline was  
23 stemmed by strong economic growth, the  
24 diversification of its employment base, tax  
25 incentives, regulatory forms that encourage the use

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 of obsolete office buildings for residences and  
3 retaining commercial tenants, as well as the  
4 creation of the Downtown Alliance.

5                   Lower Manhattan has unparalleled  
6 concentration of subways but these were designed to  
7 bring people from those areas of Brooklyn and  
8 Manhattan that were densely settled by early in the  
9 twentieth century. Subway access is limited and very  
10 congested from the East Side of Manhattan and the  
11 IRT and BMT lines from Brooklyn are extremely  
12 crowded in rush hour.

13                   Of the suburban markets, only a  
14 portion of the New Jersey commuter shed was served  
15 via the PATH into the World Trade Center.

16                   Commuters from other suburban areas  
17 could only access Lower Manhattan by changing for  
18 crowded subways. Previous Lower Manhattan  
19 revitalization efforts have repeatedly identified  
20 the mobility deficit, but high costs, competing  
21 infrastructure demands, lack of both funding and an  
22 available site for a commuter rail terminal  
23 discouraged actions to address these issues.

24                   In contrast to Lower Manhattan,  
25 Midtown is directly served by virtually all of the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 City's subway and commuter rail networks, including  
3 the PATH, the New Jersey Transit from New Jersey,  
4 MetroNorth from the northern suburbs and Connecticut  
5 and Long Island Railroad from Long Island.

6 Midtown's advantages are likely to  
7 grow as the MTA's partially funded East Side Access  
8 brings LIRR service directly to Grand Central  
9 Station, and the MTA is examining MetroNorth Service  
10 to Penn Station and New Jersey Transit, the Port  
11 Authority and the MTA have been exploring a second  
12 cross Hudson tunnel.

13 In addition to the longstanding  
14 problems with access to Lower Manhattan, there are  
15 also significant issues, as people have mentioned  
16 earlier, with movement within and across Lower  
17 Manhattan. Simply put, it is hard for pedestrians to  
18 navigate their way within Lower Manhattan.

19 Although Lower Manhattan is  
20 relatively small and compact, pedestrian movement  
21 within Lower Manhattan continues to be constrained,  
22 even without the post-September 11th disruptions,  
23 due to its irregular street pattern, as well as the  
24 barriers of West Street, as people have talked about  
25 the site of the World Trade Center, the Battery

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Tunnel, and between those places and the historic  
3 core and Battery Park City. The lower portions of  
4 Greenwich and Washington Streets have been  
5 particularly isolated.

6                   In the past, the Department of City  
7 Planning has studied the difficulty of internal  
8 movement within Lower Manhattan. One recommendation  
9 was for the creation of an internal jitney service  
10 to connect the major hubs located on the periphery.  
11 The jitney was ultimately funded by the Alliance for  
12 Downtown New York.

13                   In a few months, the Alliance will be  
14 commencing service with electric buses.

15                   The Department also recommended  
16 substantial street improvements to make walking more  
17 pleasant that were scheduled to be implemented over  
18 the next several years.

19                   While pedestrian patterns have been  
20 disrupted, as Commissioner Weinshall mentioned,  
21 resulting street construction offers an opportunity  
22 to significantly enhance the pedestrian environment.

23                   As you may know, may be aware, the  
24 Alliance supported reconstruction of Broadway will  
25 begin this spring.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   New planning efforts should examine  
3 the opportunities created by the destruction and  
4 reconstruction:

5                   - to provide new commuter rail  
6 service to Lower Manhattan.

7                   - to restore PATH service, as was  
8 mentioned.

9                   - to improve PATH, circulation of  
10 PATH riders when service is restored, including  
11 connections to the World Financial Center, Battery  
12 Park City and the subway system.

13                   - to reconfigure the streets to  
14 better connect portions of Lower Manhattan.

15                   - to improve the pedestrian  
16 experience throughout Lower Manhattan.

17                   - to better circulate commuters  
18 arriving on increased ferry service; and

19                   - to potentially expand the ferry  
20 service to new markets.

21                   The Department of City Planning has  
22 been working with the Lower Manhattan Development  
23 Corporation, Deputy Mayor Doctoroff and the many  
24 involved city, state and federal agencies, as well  
25 as civic and community organizations that have also

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 identified and explored these issues.

3                   In the coming months, we expect that  
4 a set of recommendations will emerge that will  
5 address these issues in a meaningful and fiscally  
6 realistic way.

7                   Thank you.

8                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much.

9                   We do have a couple of questions. One  
10 from Council Member Sears.

11                  COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Thank you, Mr.  
12 Chairman.

13                  I have two very brief questions. One  
14 has to do with the Port Authority, and in your plans  
15 for construction and transportation hub, working  
16 with everyone, do you think, and I'm not putting you  
17 on the spot, that the number 7 building should be  
18 built prior to having a more global transportation  
19 picture?

20                  And for the construction that you  
21 will be doing, are you mandated to do and EIS study?  
22 Because with environmental studies also comes  
23 mitigation.

24                  MS. CRACCHIOLLO: I think I will opt  
25 to answer the second question first.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   For the temporary PATH station, we  
3 believe that that is a categorical exclusion because  
4 we're replacing in-kind for the temporary station.  
5 We are still looking at the process that needs to be  
6 undertaken, as we proceed with any plans for a  
7 permanent station, or this corridor that we talked  
8 about.

9                   I don't know if I can comment on the  
10 first. I think many others, I think ultimately  
11 that's a decision that the Mayor and the Governor  
12 should really make and decide on. I think the Port  
13 Authority can work with either of those conclusions.  
14 I don't think anything precludes the transportation  
15 plan, based on the latest plans I've seen from  
16 number 7.

17                   However, we'll go with whatever  
18 decision the Mayor and the Governor decide on.

19                   COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Thank you.

20                   The other one has to do with ferry  
21 service in general, because we've heard about  
22 improving the service, increasing it, and we all  
23 know that that means, increased service means  
24 additional timetables, it means also additional  
25 ferries.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Has the ferry service over the years  
3 not really been a major focus of transportation, due  
4 to Coast Guard regulations, which may prohibit such  
5 a fleet that would be necessary, or has it not just  
6 developed over the years?

7                   MR. KAYE: Sorry, if I can answer  
8 that, Council Member.

9                   When you look at the history of ferry  
10 service in New York City, as I think Commissioner  
11 Weinshall pointed out, it was really the first  
12 version of mass transit that existed in the 19th  
13 century, and then with the construction of the  
14 subway system, the construction of the bridges and  
15 the roadway network, ferry service went into  
16 decline, to the point where by the 1960s, 1970s, the  
17 only ferry service left in the City was the  
18 municipally operated Staten Island ferry, and  
19 starting then in the late eighties, New York  
20 Waterway began to run their own private ferry  
21 service between points on the Hudson River, between  
22 New Jersey and Manhattan. Since that time, basically  
23 over the last 15 years there has been a significant  
24 increase in private ferry service to the point where  
25 now after 9/11 the ridership is over 60,000 riders a

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 day.

3                   There are a host of issues involved  
4 in planning, designing and implementing ferry  
5 service. The issue of the Coast Guard is certainly  
6 involved, as far as vessel certification, they are  
7 involved as far as traffic goes, but I don't think  
8 we're at the point yet where there's a concern that  
9 there are too many ferry vessels.

10                   I think the way the ferry service  
11 needs to expand is by focusing on the development of  
12 landings and coming up with ferry routes that  
13 provide services to communities that really need the  
14 access.

15                   COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Thank you.

16                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
17 Member Sears.

18                   We have Council Member Golden.

19                   COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Thank you, Mr.  
20 Chairman.

21                   On your testimony, Sandy Hornick, how  
22 many tunnels coming out of Brooklyn into downtown  
23 Manhattan now?

24                   MR. HORNICK: There are four subway  
25 tunnels with eight tracks.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Pardon me?

3 MR. HORNICK: How many subway tunnels  
4 coming to Lower Manhattan?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: From Brooklyn  
6 into Lower Manhattan?

7 MR. HORNICK: There are eight tracks,  
8 I think four tunnels that come in.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Four tunnels.  
10 Are there any plans for additional  
11 tunnels?

12 MR. HORNICK: Well, there's been a lot  
13 of talk over the years for additional tunnels.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Is it moving  
15 beyond talk?

16 MR. HORNICK: The issues of how you  
17 bring additional service into Lower Manhattan are  
18 part of the issues that people are talking about  
19 now.

20 We have done studies over the years  
21 about other connections, connections to supplement  
22 the Manhattan Bridge in particular, or to take some  
23 traffic off the Manhattan Bridge. It is actually  
24 anticipated that to 2006 the Manhattan Bridge will  
25 have four tracks again, I forget the year, and we

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 are looking at, you know, whether -- as part of the  
3 things we're looking at in terms of bringing things  
4 here, we have looked at whether another tunnel is  
5 plausible, either for subway or for commuter rail.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: I'm one of the  
7 guys that suffered that Manhattan Bridge that was  
8 going to close for two years in 1984, I think.

9 MR. HORNICK: Right.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: 1985, for two  
11 years. This is 2002 and it's not going to open up  
12 until 2006, right?

13 MR. HORNICK: I'm scratching my memory  
14 to see if that's the right date, but it's something  
15 like that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: And then when  
17 that tunnel went down in Manhattan, then we had no N  
18 train or R train and that's why today the ferry is a  
19 lifesaver at 58th Street and First Avenue.

20 I'm hoping that the City Planning and  
21 others, will take a look at additional tunnels  
22 coming out of Downtown Brooklyn, and if you could  
23 get back to this Committee to let us know if there  
24 are further plans for a study or for actual  
25 tunneling, we'd appreciate that.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   On the four sets of tunnels, are  
3 there interconnectors, can there be more tunneling  
4 to interconnect to the other tunnels in case a set  
5 of tracks go down to alleviate some congestion in  
6 either the IRT side or the N W Q R side.

7                   MR. HORNICK: You know, they will  
8 testify, the MTA, later, I don't know, they would  
9 probably be more expert than I, but the two systems,  
10 the IRT and the EMT, IND, and I don't think they use  
11 those letters anymore, but I'm old enough to think  
12 in those terms, aren't really interchangeable.

13                   COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Today they're  
14 not interchangeable.

15                   MR. HORNICK: No, no. The subway cars  
16 on the IRT system are narrower and they can't run on  
17 the BMT and IND systems. The IND and BMT system is  
18 too wide to go on the IRT line.

19                   The short answer to this question is,  
20 it's easy to draw lines on the map, the City has an  
21 opportunity here as it rethinks Lower Manhattan to  
22 sort of make decisions about where it wants to make  
23 investments.

24                   These investments cost a lot of money  
25 and it has to make some careful choices about which

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 ones it wants to make, and I think that's going to  
3 be part of the debate over the next several months,  
4 or whatever, about what kinds of investments we want  
5 to make and what kinds of investments we can afford.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: The latest  
7 statistics coming back, 2.7 million people live in  
8 the County of Kings, Brooklyn, and I'm one of them,  
9 and obviously we do not have enough ways of getting  
10 off of Brooklyn, or getting into Manhattan or out of  
11 Manhattan come 9/11, so hopefully the planning will  
12 take that into consideration as to trying to connect  
13 to other tunnels, or trying to find the right cars  
14 to fit the right tunnels, or additional tunneling,  
15 and that definitely would help not only the City of  
16 Brooklyn, but definitely help the City of Manhattan  
17 and New York City as a whole.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
20 Member Golden.

21 At this point I would just ask  
22 everybody to indulge me in a very quick break for  
23 three minutes and we will -- excuse me. We do have  
24 another set of questions from Council Member Gerson.

25 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Very few. Very

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 small set.

3                   First to Mr. Cracchiollo. If I  
4 mispronounce your name, forgive me. But thank you  
5 for being so forthcoming. I heard this presentation  
6 at a community board meeting, as you recall, a  
7 couple of weeks ago.

8                   MR. CRACCHIOLLO: Yes.

9                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: And where we I  
10 think all expressed great enthusiasm for the people  
11 mover, and I think we also expressed great  
12 enthusiasm for the idea of extending the people  
13 mover east of Broadway, indeed all the way east to  
14 the South Street Seaport area, and I'm wondering if  
15 since that really you've given that any more  
16 thought, any more ideas as to its viability,  
17 desirability, feasibility?

18                   MR. CRACCHIOLLO: Well, we have not  
19 studied it in any detail. We've discussed it with  
20 our partners at the MTA. I think again, as my  
21 colleague said just a minute ago, I think  
22 potentially it's feasible. I mean, without doing the  
23 engineering potentially it's feasible. It's a  
24 question of dollars and investment, and we felt that  
25 the portion that we were proposing at this moment

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 from Broadway to the World Financial Center was the  
3 most critical portion to be built first and was  
4 potentially fundable, although we don't have the  
5 funds at present, it's within a fundable range of  
6 several billion dollars, and buildable within four  
7 to five years.

8                   Obviously, you could go further east  
9 and, you know, you can embellish it with connections  
10 to other modes of transportation. I would suggest  
11 that potentially is a Phase II or a later phase,  
12 given that we do have limited funds and we do have  
13 limited capability to do all the things we would  
14 like to do.

15                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: But your gut  
16 feeling, the extension of a people mover, or as I  
17 know one of my good friends in the audience might  
18 suggest, perhaps some kind of an underground or a  
19 trolley system, but the idea of a connection all the  
20 way to the South Street east side from West Street;  
21 gut feeling, good idea?

22                   MR. CRACCHIOLLO: I think it's  
23 potentially feasible. You know, again, someone would  
24 have to look at how many people would use it, et  
25 cetera, what's the cost benefit ratio. But

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 certainly, anything that connects cross town is  
3 going to be helpful downtown.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: And to Mr.  
5 Hornick, just two quick questions. I will ask them  
6 together.

7 Do you have any sense, you referred  
8 to relative numbers, but do you have any sense of  
9 the ratios in terms of how many commuters are  
10 brought into Lower Manhattan by PATH as opposed to  
11 how many commuters travel into Lower Manhattan from  
12 MetroNorth and from LIRR?

13 And then as a follow-up to that, when  
14 you talk about the connecting Lower Manhattan from  
15 the commuter railways, are there any alternatives,  
16 alternative connections, to a direct rail  
17 connection, which I'm sure would inflict quite a bit  
18 of disruption, without comment on whether good or  
19 bad, whether we should do it, are there  
20 alternatives, alternative ways of connecting Lower  
21 Manhattan to Grand Central or to Penn Station  
22 without the direct railway?

23 MR. HORNICK: The answer is there is  
24 an unbelievable number of alternatives that people  
25 are looking at, including us and I'm sure other

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 people as well, and people on the outside, some of  
3 them turn out to be just not workable, some of them  
4 turn out to be extremely expensive. Ultimately a  
5 certain number will filter out as being the ones  
6 that make the most sense to look at.

7                   What the level of disruption that  
8 they create really depends on what kind of  
9 construction. They may, if things, assuming there  
10 are viable alternatives, and fundable alternatives,  
11 which we haven't gotten to yet, then the question is  
12 how to you build. If you are doing deep tunneling,  
13 there may be very, very little disruption. So, that  
14 remains to be seen, just how much disruption they  
15 cause, and of course how they fit in with the rest  
16 of the program for rebuilding, because what goes  
17 down below very much relates to what goes on up  
18 above, and the memorial and what other buildings go  
19 on the site.

20                   In terms of the relative numbers of  
21 people that are -- what did you say, 65,000 PATH  
22 riders, or maybe a little more, prior to September  
23 11th, according to the census there are about,  
24 roughly 30, a little over 30,000 people who come  
25 from Long Island, a smaller number that come from

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 the northern suburbs.

3 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: I'm sorry, my  
4 truly last question: This talk about the commuter  
5 freight railway that we've heard over the years,  
6 should that fit into the strategic planning? I mean,  
7 we know, you know, it's the design to alleviate  
8 truck traffic, and it seems to me that should be  
9 part of a broad strategic plan, but no one has  
10 mentioned it or brought it up, so I'm curious if you  
11 all are considering that proposal as part of your  
12 ongoing strategic work?

13 MR. KAYE: Well, let me address that  
14 since EDC is the elite agency on the cross harbor  
15 freight movement study.

16 As the title indicates, the study is  
17 focused on various strategies for improving the  
18 movement of freight across New York Harbor, one of  
19 the alternatives that is being examined, of course,  
20 is the notion of a cross harbor rail freight tunnel  
21 that is now in the EIS phase. The EIS will be  
22 completed later this year, go on to the Federal  
23 Highway Administration, the Federal Railroad  
24 Administration for a record of decisions, so we  
25 expect the process will be completed by mid-2003.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 That study is not necessarily focused on Lower  
3 Manhattan, of course, that is focused on regional  
4 movement of goods. And obviously, since September  
5 11th we have added a strategic redundancy component  
6 to the preliminary engineering, as well as the  
7 environmental work, so those issues will be examined  
8 specifically, or are being examined, I should say,  
9 specifically in terms of what are the effects if  
10 there were interruptions in the regional roadway  
11 system in terms of moving goods in and out of the  
12 city.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Thank you very  
14 much.

15 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, Council  
16 Member Gerson.

17 We have a quick question from Council  
18 Member Lanza.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANZA: Thank you,  
20 Chairmen. And thank you all for the important work  
21 that you're doing with respect to the great  
22 opportunity that I believe this downtown transit hub  
23 represents for this city as we seek to rebuild and  
24 restore the economy and quality of life.

25 I submit to you, though, that a hub

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 is only as good as the spokes which connect with it.

3                   Simply put, unless you provide viable  
4 mass transit options to the tens of thousands of  
5 commuters that commute every single day from the  
6 outer boroughs, we will not full realize all that  
7 such a transit hub represents.

8                   I represent the southern portion of  
9 Staten Island in which each day tens of thousands of  
10 commuters are confronted by probably the most  
11 difficult and longest commute to the City. That  
12 being said, I direct this really to the Port  
13 Authority, who I know is currently evaluating a  
14 number of fast ferry options, with respect to  
15 filling some of the gaps, and at this point I'd like  
16 to cast my lot with I believe every single member of  
17 this Committee, to underscore the importance of  
18 continuing to evaluate those options. I think it's  
19 important that we not only evaluate but bring  
20 on-line fast ferry service, given the resource of  
21 the waterways, as a way to bring people from the  
22 outer boroughs, out of their cars, off the roads,  
23 and let them more easily connect to such a hub.

24                   MR. CRACCHIOLLO: If I can comment,  
25 yes, I absolutely agree. The Port Authority has

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 been working very diligently, not only since  
3 September 11th, but for several years, on trying to  
4 improve and increase ferry services from the outer  
5 boroughs, as well as from points in New Jersey, and  
6 Upstate in Westchester County, and we are still  
7 doing that.

8 I think for anyone that didn't  
9 believe ferries were a viable transportation  
10 alternative, after September 11th I think ferries  
11 have proven themselves. They're not a 19th century  
12 method of transportation, they're clearly a 21st  
13 century method of transportation, and we cannot  
14 minimize how important they are in supporting our  
15 transportation systems, particularly in Lower  
16 Manhattan, where walking distances and distances  
17 from the rivers to the various buildings, both  
18 residential and commercial are fairly short.

19 So, we certainly applaud you,  
20 Councilman, in your position and we support it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANZA: And just very  
22 quickly, on behalf of Councilman Golden, if you can  
23 provide us with the information with regard to how  
24 many people each day commute on the eight lines  
25 coming in from Brooklyn and Queens into Manhattan, I

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 would appreciate that.

3 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: How many people come  
4 into Lower Manhattan? Well, let's see, there's  
5 370,000 -- there were 370,000 workers, let's work  
6 backwards, from Brooklyn and Queens -- we can get  
7 back to you. We have the numbers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: Is there any  
9 transportation on the Manhattan Bridge presently? Or  
10 there's none at all?

11 MR. CRACCHIOLLO: The southern two  
12 tracks are operating.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GOLDEN: If you can  
14 give me that number, as well. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LIU: All right, let's  
16 take a short break, three minutes. In three minutes  
17 we will reconvene. We have a number of organizations  
18 that have a great deal of expertise in this matter  
19 and I would love to hear from them.

20 Thank you.

21 (Recess taken.)

22 CHAIRPERSON LIU: We will resume our  
23 hearing. I would like to get everybody out of here  
24 at a reasonable hour.

25 This morning I would like to invite

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Richard Muller, from the Manhattan Borough  
3 President's Office, as well as Robert Gottheim, from  
4 Congressman Nadler's Office, to come give us  
5 comments.

6                   Welcome, gentlemen. Shall we have Mr.  
7 Muller go first?

8                   MR. MULLER: Good afternoon, Mr.  
9 Chair. My name is Richard Muller, and I am pleased  
10 to present the comments of Manhattan Borough  
11 President C. Virginia Fields on the reconstruction  
12 of the transportation infrastructure in downtown  
13 Manhattan.

14                   First Borough President Fields wants  
15 me to convey her appreciation to you for convening  
16 this hearing on what may be the most important  
17 element of the revitalization of this part of our  
18 borough, which has seen such unbelievable  
19 devastation.

20                   Our transportation infrastructure is  
21 the element that will make downtown inviting and  
22 easy to get to, around in and through. Crucial  
23 design elements of the rebuilding including  
24 convenient mass transit, ease of transfer from one  
25 mode of transportation to another, a human scale,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 pedestrian-friendly street grid that is neighborhood  
3 based, and a downtown tied to an active revitalized  
4 waterfront.

5                   The Borough President sees the need  
6 for both short-term and long-term planning. The  
7 Alliance for Downtown New York has a plan for  
8 improving the streetscape on Broadway, including  
9 lighting and making street furniture uniform.

10                   As downtown continues to open up, the  
11 streets and sidewalks need to be made more permeable  
12 to pedestrians by, for example, replacing as many  
13 Jersey barriers with attractive and uniformly  
14 designed bollards.

15                   The meetings of the interagency  
16 Committee on Lower Manhattan, chaired by the New  
17 York City Department of Transportation Commissioner  
18 for Lower Manhattan, Andrew Salkin, are just the  
19 kind of cooperation and communication we need to  
20 improve the downtown streets and sidewalks.

21                   As we plan, Borough President Fields  
22 wants everyone to remember that the East Side of  
23 lower Manhattan, which includes Chinatown and the  
24 Lower East Side, was in dire need of improved  
25 transit connections even before September 11th. The

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 full length Second Avenue subway, augmented by a  
3 redesigned full-service surface transportation  
4 network is a crucial link in uniting all of our  
5 downtown neighborhoods post September 11th.

6                   Moreover, the Second Avenue subway is  
7 the answer to the question raised by the Lower  
8 Manhattan Access Study. It found that the Lexington  
9 Avenue line is the preferred way to get downtown  
10 from Midtown. Unfortunately, this same line is at  
11 capacity, so how can it accommodate the growth we  
12 plan to see, unfortunately -- I'm sorry --  
13 fortunately the Second Avenue subway is the answer.

14                   There is talk of various ways of  
15 bringing commuter rail to downtown, some of which  
16 would rely on existing subway tracks. The obvious  
17 concern is that commuter rail should not displace  
18 cars nor riders from our mass transit system. There  
19 may be unused tunnels and tracks for such options,  
20 but in these financially constrained times we have  
21 been making some hard choices.

22                   We need to speak with one voice to  
23 the federal government, when we ask for transit  
24 dollars, and it makes sense for all of us to be on  
25 board with the Second Avenue subway.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Ninety percent of the people who come  
3 to downtown Manhattan come by mass transit. The Port  
4 Authority is developing a plan for a super hub that  
5 we've heard about that will connect all of the  
6 subway lines across Fulton Street underground to the  
7 PATH and ferry landings.

8                   This is the kind of intermodal  
9 connectivity we must foster and support. The  
10 Metropolitan Transportation Authority should be  
11 congratulated for their efforts and investment in  
12 working to rapidly restore our subway system to  
13 normal.

14                   The Lower Manhattan Development  
15 Corporation, and all the organizations under the  
16 umbrella of the civic alliance are also making a  
17 significant contribution with their open forums for  
18 ideas from the best and brightest the city has to  
19 offer.

20                   Some of the many good ideas being  
21 discussed are a bus terminal for Lower Manhattan,  
22 dedicated bus lanes that are actively enforced, taxi  
23 stops at corners, value pricing of parking to  
24 officially allocate scarce street space, and widen  
25 sidewalks and pedestrian malls that make downtown

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 more livable and walkable.

3                   Finally, this superblock concept for  
4 the World Trade Center site itself should give way  
5 to a restored street grid that connects the site  
6 with the surrounding neighborhoods.

7                   Ferries were a crucial element of the  
8 evacuation of workers and residents from Lower  
9 Manhattan on September 11th, but even before that  
10 faithful day, ferry transportation had been enjoying  
11 a resurgence as a result of the efforts of the Port  
12 Authority, the Economic Development Corporation, and  
13 especially Alan Olmsted of the Department of  
14 Transportation. Deputy Mayor Doctoroff is also to be  
15 congratulated for establishing an interagency task  
16 force on ferries.

17                   The temporary ferry terminal at  
18 Historic Battery Park has been essential in helping  
19 reconnect employees with their places of work. While  
20 desperately needed, an unfortunate consequence of  
21 the terminal has been to block the view corridor to  
22 our waterfront. A permanent location for the service  
23 needs to be addressed, and perhaps the Coast Guard's  
24 facilities at the prow of Historic Battery Park  
25 should be considered.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Use of this area for ferry  
3 transportation would facilitate improved access to  
4 the central and eastern portions of downtown.

5                   In addition, the potential extension  
6 of the 1/9 lines to this area, coupled with the  
7 bikeway which Borough President Fields intends to  
8 allocate funding to, will certainly enhance  
9 connectivity downtown.

10                  There's more testimony about details  
11 about ferries, just that obviously when we develop  
12 ferry service we have to keep in mind wake control,  
13 so that we don't further stress the infrastructure  
14 that we're spending so much to restore, and also  
15 that with every single transportation mode, our air  
16 quality is a primary consideration, and that goes  
17 with, that applies to waterborne transit as well.  
18 So, we have to make sure that our ferries run  
19 cleanly.

20                  We have the opportunity to modernize  
21 the transportation infrastructure built 80 to 100  
22 years ago that was serving a modern city.

23                  Borough President Fields looks  
24 forward to working with your committees and the new  
25 administration on developing a transportation

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 infrastructure that will meet the needs of  
3 Manhattan's and the region's next hundred years.

4 Thank you for the opportunity to  
5 comment.

6 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you.

7 And now we have Robert Gottheim from  
8 Congressman Jerrold Nadler's Office.

9 MR. GOTTHEIM: Thank you very much. My  
10 name is Robert Gottheim. I am Congressman Nadler's  
11 Brooklyn District Director and Transportation Policy  
12 Analyst. Unfortunately the Congressman couldn't be  
13 here today to give his testimony, he is in  
14 Washington, so I am here in his stead.

15 His testimony is: It is a pleasure to  
16 address the New York City Council Transportation  
17 Committee and the Select Committee on Lower  
18 Manhattan Redevelopment concerning the opportunities  
19 to reconstruct the transportation infrastructure at  
20 and around the World Trade Center site in a  
21 multi-modal manner.

22 I would especially like to thank  
23 Councilman John Liu, Chairman of the Transportation  
24 Committee, for organizing this important hearing.

25 I'm sure today's hearing will be both

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 productive in discussing the issue of rebuilding  
3 Lower Manhattan and the City.

4                   We are here today to discuss  
5 transportation and infrastructure of Lower Manhattan  
6 and how it might be affected following the September  
7 11th attacks.

8                   I have a proposal, and I think that  
9 it would be most useful in achieving the goal of  
10 revitalizing the area as we rebuild.

11                   I propose that we rebuild a subway  
12 line which would shuttle passengers one block  
13 between Warren Street and Murray Street, using the  
14 power of pneumatic air pressure generated by a giant  
15 fan.

16                   Sounds ridiculous to you? Maybe it  
17 does now. But back in 1870, when Alfred E. Beach  
18 operated the first subway line using the  
19 specifications I just mentioned, it created quite a  
20 buzz throughout Manhattan as being a revolution in  
21 moving people in the City.

22                   In fact, in its first year of  
23 operation, 400,000 visitors paid 25 cents a ride to  
24 ride the thing back and forth.

25                   As much as that line was an

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 incredible feat for 1870, it would be absurd to say  
3 we should revive that line today, because it is an  
4 antique. Likewise, what is left of the  
5 transportation and infrastructure in the area was an  
6 awesome achievement in the early part of the 20th  
7 century, but by today's standards, it is also  
8 considered an antique.

9                   Honestly, I wish I did not have to be  
10 here today to discuss this issue in these terms. I  
11 would much rather that Lower Manhattan be intact,  
12 and we had a hearing on modernizing the systems that  
13 fell on deaf ears because there didn't seem to be  
14 any sense of urgency. But that is not the case.  
15 Whether or not we like it, we are forced to rebuild.  
16 And so the question arises: Are we going to rebuild  
17 an antique or are we going to look forward?

18                   I was pleased to hear that a few  
19 weeks earlier Mayor Bloomberg wants to have the most  
20 modern and efficient Lower Manhattan that money can  
21 buy. Mayor Bloomberg said that he envisions  
22 rebuilding Lower Manhattan into a 24 by 7  
23 destination, not just an 8 by 5 location. I couldn't  
24 agree more.

25                   To do so, we must be bold in our

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 thinking and willing to invest every single cent it  
3 will take. We must shift our thinking not so much  
4 towards the most evident issues of congestion  
5 downtown and pollution downtown and merely moving  
6 people back and forth between Point A and Point B,  
7 but towards the interconnectivity of the City's  
8 financial centers in the 21st Century.

9                   As you know, the commercial sector of  
10 the City is now divided into three parts. Now, that  
11 would be fine if this was Gaul, and I was Julius  
12 Caesar trying to conquer it. But to make New York  
13 into the financial capital of the world in the 21st  
14 century, the economic centers of Downtown, Midtown,  
15 and Midtown West can be separate geographically, but  
16 must be flawlessly interconnected.

17                   Just what sort of things would it  
18 take to achieve this? First we must look at creating  
19 a Grand Central Station of sorts for Lower  
20 Manhattan, a place where all subway lines and PATH  
21 lines meet, to rebuild and revitalize one of the  
22 City's most vibrant centers, it will take people  
23 coming there, a lot of people. A hub station of this  
24 sort will make Lower Manhattan into one of the most  
25 easily accessible and natural destinations in the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 City.

3                   Related to this and equally as  
4 important is extending subway service down the west  
5 side into Battery Park City.

6                   I don't know if any of you have ever  
7 tried to get from Battery Park City all the way to  
8 the east side to catch a line uptown, but it's a  
9 nightmare.

10                   We must also take a look at  
11 modernizing the subway system as a whole, with a  
12 special emphasis on making it safe.

13                   No one will want to ride the service,  
14 especially if it's under a constant threat of  
15 terrorist attack. Unless we can ensure that the air  
16 will be safe because of modern ventilation and can  
17 be easily evacuated in the case of the worst.

18                   Following the September 11th attacks,  
19 we saw just how efficient and important ferry  
20 service was to the City.

21                   It is far too underutilized mode of  
22 transportation, and I was happy to see that Mayor  
23 Bloomberg seems committed to expansion of this  
24 service.

25                   I was able to help secure 100 million

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 in funding for ferry service, and I would like to  
3 see even more invested. Not only to more easily  
4 bring people back and forth from New Jersey, but  
5 also an expansion of service up the Hudson.

6                   Even with top notch subway service,  
7 Manhattan is still congested. If we are truly to  
8 make this City into one, investment into ferries is  
9 one of the most obvious considerations.

10                   Finally, if we are truly to build a  
11 better Lower Manhattan and a better New York, it is  
12 a must that we bring goods into the City by means  
13 other than trucks, which only serve to rip up our  
14 roads and bridges, clog up our streets by trucks  
15 cutting across Manhattan via Canal Street and  
16 spewing hazardous exhaust into the air.

17                   For those of you who know me, it will  
18 come as no surprise that I believe having a cross  
19 harbor freight, rail freight tunnel, that would  
20 connect the port with the northeast rail corridor is  
21 a must for the 21st century. Make no mistake, while  
22 it would have a very visible and practical affects  
23 on Lower Manhattan, it is a project that the City as  
24 a whole cannot survive without economically.

25                   In the same vain, I believe that we

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 need to take a look at restoring the two-way toll on  
3 the Verrazano Bridge. The one way toll has only  
4 served to further clog the streets of Lower  
5 Manhattan, as truckers seem to avoid the toll on  
6 Staten Island, transverse Canal Street en route to  
7 their destinations in mainland America. I have  
8 introduced legislation in Congress to change this  
9 procedure.

10                   There are many other proposals that  
11 should be looked at, including building pedestrian  
12 thoroughfares, having a more efficient system of  
13 truck deliveries through a central distribution  
14 center, possibly in the heart of the new structure  
15 at the World Trade Center, and a completion of the  
16 Second Avenue subway and east side access projects.

17                   I hope we will have the opportunity  
18 to discuss all these issues in more detail during  
19 the panel discussions.

20                   However, I wanted to make clear from  
21 the outset, that before we start throwing out  
22 various ideas, we need to get in the right frame of  
23 mind.

24                   In 1870, Alfred Beach was in the  
25 right frame of mind when he envisioned underground

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 rail cars powered by massive fans. It was bold  
3 thinking and it was visionary in that it sought to  
4 deal with the expansion of the City uptown. Now,  
5 that time has gone, and this City is to make another  
6 metamorphosis. Now is the time to think boldly  
7 again. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much  
9 for your comments.

10 I would also mention that Senator Tom  
11 Duane had a representative here but they needed to  
12 get going, but they have provided written testimony,  
13 and if anybody would like a copy, I believe we have  
14 copies off to my left. And please thank Congressman  
15 Nadler for his vision and for his persistency and  
16 steadfastness in areas of transportation issues.

17 MR. GOTTHEIM: I certainly will. Thank  
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON LIU: We have a number of  
20 organizations that I am personally excited to hear  
21 from, and, again, our meeting is running pretty  
22 long, but I do want to keep this as focused as  
23 possible on the issue at hand, which is the  
24 potential for an integrated transit system in Lower  
25 Manhattan.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 I'm very delighted that we have  
3 Jeffrey Zupan, from the Regional Plan Association  
4 joining us.

5 Let me just say that there are a  
6 number of other organizations here with us today,  
7 and, so, what I have coming down the pike after Mr.  
8 Zupan gives us his testimony is the Alliance for  
9 Downtown New York, and this would be the order of  
10 appearance. Alliance for Downtown New York,  
11 Transportation Alternatives, Metropolitan Waterfront  
12 Alliance, Tristate Transportation Campaign,  
13 Straphangers Campaign, New York Water Taxi, Atlantic  
14 Sale Charter and AutoFree New York, and this was  
15 roughly the order that people arrived to this  
16 meeting.

17 Thank you, Mr. Zupan, and welcome.

18 MR. ZUPAN: Okay. My name is Jeffrey  
19 Zupan. I'm Senior Fellow for Transportation at  
20 Regional Plan Association. Thank you for allowing me  
21 to speak today about a vital issue affecting all New  
22 Yorkers.

23 RPA has been a planning and advocacy  
24 organization in the tri-state Metropolitan Region  
25 for almost 80 years. Currently, we are the convener

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 of the Civic Alliance, an organization of some 85  
3 organizations formed to provide a civic voice for  
4 the rebuilding of Lower Manhattan.

5                   However, today I speak for RPA,  
6 although many of the points I am covering have  
7 received the endorsement of the Civic Alliance.

8                   I just want to, I'm going to  
9 paraphrase some of my testimony, in the interest of  
10 time, but I think that the one point I want to make  
11 early on is the importance of building confidence in  
12 people, workers, employers, residents of Lower  
13 Manhattan that Lower Manhattan is coming back.

14                   So, we need to be able to build that  
15 confidence. Leases are going to be re-signed, or  
16 not, on the basis of that, among other things, and  
17 we need to make sure that confidence is there.

18                   We obviously have to build for a  
19 quality of life, to deal with security, to create  
20 the ubiquitous connectivity that we've been talking  
21 about and sufficient capacity for our transportation  
22 system, and we need to do that as quickly as  
23 possible, but not necessarily too hasty. That's kind  
24 of a big hurdle to overcome. We've got to find that  
25 balance.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   To that end, we are gratified that  
3 the MTA's Transit Unit was able to restore service  
4 on the N and R subway trains in less than two months  
5 after September 11th, and that they plan to have the  
6 1 and 9 back in service within a year.

7                   Similarly, the Port Authority, as you  
8 heard earlier, has announced that it will be able to  
9 put PATH, the PATH station under the World Trade  
10 Center site back in operation before the end of  
11 2003, and New York City DOT has been a leader in  
12 restoring this street network quickly as well. All  
13 three agencies deserve our gratitude for their  
14 efforts.

15                   As part of these rebuilding efforts,  
16 these facilities should be upgraded to overcome  
17 their pre-9/11 weaknesses and deficiencies. This  
18 means that the rebuilding of the 1 and 9 and the N  
19 and R train stations at the World Trade Center site  
20 be designed in the way it creates a much more  
21 user-friendly movement between the subways and  
22 streets. It means that the obsolete 1 and 9 loop at  
23 South Ferry be replaced with a modern station that  
24 will make it much easier to move between the Staten  
25 Island ferries, and I'm glad to see that Councilman

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Lanza is still here, and other ferry operations at  
3 the Battery, including restored Battery Maritime  
4 building as well.

5                   It means that PATH much reach further  
6 to the east to be able to connect the subway system  
7 at least as far as Broadway Nassau Station complex  
8 at Fulton Street and Broadway, and it means that the  
9 connections between the World Trade Center site and  
10 the World Financial Center must overcome the barrier  
11 of an extra wide West Street.

12                   The design shown by the Port  
13 Authority earlier to accomplish this with a Grand  
14 Concourse underground connecting all of the subway  
15 lines is a creative way to accomplish these  
16 objectives and deserves endorsement by the City  
17 Council.

18                   Together the Concourse and the MTA  
19 station can become the Grand Central Terminal South  
20 some have spoken about. We look forward to seeing  
21 what the MTA is planning for the design of the  
22 Broadway end of this Concourse at the subway station  
23 complex there. I must note that I'm disappointed  
24 that the MTA is not here today.

25                   I want to stress the importance of

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 getting the PATH improvements right. Over 60,000 New  
3 Jersey residents a day use the PATH system, the PATH  
4 station at the World Trade Center most to come to  
5 work in New York City. To the extent that the  
6 replacement station is compromised in its  
7 attractiveness for commuters, it will drive away  
8 jobs in New York with the obvious loss of those jobs  
9 to sites in New Jersey.

10                   The Council should make an active  
11 interest in making sure the PATH station is restored  
12 and improved to keep jobs in Manhattan and not  
13 compromised.

14                   The second coming of age of ferries  
15 has taken place since September 11th. Lower  
16 Manhattan is the ideal location for ferry service,  
17 since most of it is within walking distance of the  
18 water's edge. The City should support improvements  
19 in the ferry service that takes advantage of this  
20 and fill niches to serve those areas where ground  
21 transit service is especially poor. The south end of  
22 Staten Island and Rockaway is one such area that  
23 comes -- two such areas that come to mind.

24                   Improvements should include a new  
25 intermodal terminal at the Battery Marine Terminal,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Maritime Terminal, as I mentioned earlier, Long  
3 Island Railroad track and station improvements in  
4 Long Island City for fast ferries to Lower  
5 Manhattan, a sensitively located harbor-wide network  
6 of ferry and water taxi stations in all the  
7 boroughs, and carefully select the suburban  
8 communities to provide improved service to Lower  
9 Manhattan Shore Line stops.

10                   There should also be consideration of  
11 subsidizing ferry services that cannot pay for  
12 themselves, just as is done for other transit modes.  
13 For the most part, the ferries that we have have  
14 been revived, since the 1980s, and even more  
15 recently, are not subsidized. By subsidizing ferries  
16 we enlarge the scope of where ferries might be able  
17 to be provided, and we think this Council should  
18 take a lead on this. We know that the City DOT is  
19 very heavily involved, as is the Port Authority and  
20 as are we.

21                   As for the streets in Lower  
22 Manhattan, they will be under a great deal of stress  
23 in the next year or two, as they are now, as  
24 reconstruction of utilities take place and  
25 construction vehicles are ubiquitous.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   It's critical that there be a plan  
3 for how to use the public space where pedestrians  
4 must compete with vehicles of every type, buses for  
5 commuters and tourists, trucks for building and  
6 utility construction, trucks for packages and goods  
7 delivery, taxis, black cars, passenger cars, and, of  
8 course, emergency vehicles.

9                   The plan must fairly allocate these  
10 uses in both time and in space. We call upon the  
11 City and the Port Authority to work together with  
12 the range of interests in Lower Manhattan to put  
13 such a plan in place together that regains the  
14 vitality that Lower Manhattan had before September  
15 11th.

16                   At the immediate World Trade Center  
17 site, the street grid that was interrupted by the  
18 original World Trade Center should be restored so  
19 that walking, but not driving, through the site is  
20 made direct and logical. This relates to the  
21 decision about the design of the building to replace  
22 World Trade Center No. 7. It should not block the  
23 line of site nor impede the movement of pedestrians  
24 down Greenwich Street and West Broadway.

25                   The car pool rule, or SOV ban between

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 6:00 am and 10:00 am each weekday should remain in  
3 place. It has proven immensely effective in keeping  
4 unneeded traffic out of Lower Manhattan, easing  
5 traffic throughout Manhattan south of 60th Street,  
6 which has speeded up buses, taxis and trucks, but  
7 most importantly helped speed rescue recovery and  
8 rebuilding efforts.

9                   There has been no credible evidence,  
10 I want to emphasize credible evidence, that the car  
11 pool rule has been the cause of any broad economic  
12 impact on the City.

13                   Eventually, the replacement of the  
14 car pool rule with variable time of day tolls at the  
15 East River crossings, as has been done successfully  
16 at the Hudson River, can keep traffic volumes down,  
17 relieve congestion and raise funds to make the  
18 necessary transit improvements, especially in  
19 Brooklyn and Queens.

20                   This can be done with high speed  
21 E-ZPass toll sensors that do not create queues,  
22 contrary to what some have said.

23                   Improving Transit service to Lower  
24 Manhattan is crucial to the economic and social  
25 recovery of the area.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Fortunately, the MTA has made a  
3 commitment to the full-length Second Avenue subway,  
4 and every elected official in Manhattan, I believe,  
5 has wisely endorsed it. It will relieve the jammed  
6 Lexington Avenue line and bring two new services to  
7 Lower Manhattan in addition to that.

8                   The ability to deliver people from  
9 the Upper East Side and the northern suburbs  
10 comfortably, and from the Bronx, I might add, and  
11 reliably to the financial district, has been a  
12 glaring weakness in the transit system and the  
13 Second Avenue subway will overcome this.

14                   RPA is proud to have been a supporter  
15 of this full line, working with many elected  
16 officials, which was originally slated to be built  
17 only as far as 63rd Street. It is critical that the  
18 momentum for this project remains strong and  
19 distractions be avoided that would shift priorities  
20 from it.

21                   But having a line at each end of  
22 Manhattan is not enough. Our original subway, Second  
23 Avenue subway plan proposed that this service be  
24 extended to Jamaica and JFK Airport to serve  
25 residents of Brooklyn and Queens, and be extended to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 the Bronx as well, and to Long Islanders and airport  
3 travelers.

4                   It also would serve all those  
5 unserved parts of the Bronx.

6                   Let me emphasize that our plan would  
7 create a direct one-seat ride from Lower Manhattan  
8 to Kennedy Airport. Let me say that again. A direct  
9 one-seat ride from Lower Manhattan to Kennedy  
10 Airport.

11                   I can't think of any one single thing  
12 that can help revive Lower Manhattan than direct  
13 service to all the financial markets around the  
14 world, which would give a tremendous boost,  
15 obviously, to the economy of the financial district.

16                   It is also important that Lower  
17 Manhattan have improved connections to the suburbs  
18 on Long Island and Westchester and New Jersey.  
19 Toward that end, we are aware of a proposal to  
20 extend the Long Island Railroad into Lower  
21 Manhattan, using tracks now used by the A and C  
22 subway lines.

23                   When this proposal is made public, we  
24 look forward to examining it in detail to see if it  
25 is feasible both from an operating and construction

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 point of view, and if it is cost-effective.

3                   It must be judged by several  
4 criteria, aside from its constructability as well.

5                   Will it negatively affect travel for  
6 subway and PATH riders? Will it improve service for  
7 Long Island Railroad riders sufficiently to warrant  
8 its cost?

9                   Do those benefits provide, offer good  
10 value, compared to committed to projects, priority  
11 projects, other priority projects?

12                   We look forward to working with the  
13 City Council during these difficult and challenging  
14 times so that New York City emerges stronger than  
15 ever.

16                   Thank you very much.

17                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you for your  
18 comments.

19                   Do we have any questions for the  
20 Regional Plan Association?

21                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Yes.

22                   Hi. I want you to know the sound  
23 system here works very well, that I was listening to  
24 every word.

25                   MR. ZUPAN: I was going to ask you

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 about that because I raised the Number 7 World Trade  
3 Center when you were out there, and I know you asked  
4 earlier about it.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Well, I  
6 appreciate that. And I congratulate you for that.

7 I wanted, though, just to start by  
8 asking you also about this commuter line connection,  
9 and we're not quite sure -- I gather your position  
10 is that there are alternatives to a direct extension  
11 of the commuter railway lines from Grand Central and  
12 Penn Station down to Lower Manhattan?

13 MR. ZUPAN: No. That's not our  
14 position. This is, as Sandy Hornick had mentioned  
15 earlier, this thing has been studied continually and  
16 the difficulty of extending a line from Midtown to  
17 Lower Manhattan has always been the cost and  
18 constructability and the relatively low number of  
19 riders it would serve.

20 Some have argued, and I think the  
21 Downtown Alliance is here, would argue that if you  
22 did have that line, more people would naturally work  
23 in Lower Manhattan who live from the northern  
24 suburbs and the Long Island suburbs and that to some  
25 degree is true, you would induce more traffic on

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 these lines.

3                   I think now it seems that most of the  
4 interest in bringing commuter rail to Lower  
5 Manhattan is from the Long Island sector,  
6 recognizing that that's the sector that, one, has  
7 more ridership, and secondly, it may be possible to  
8 actually construct something.

9                   As I indicated in my testimony, I saw  
10 in the paper a couple of weeks ago there was  
11 reference to a proposal, but I'm not certain of what  
12 the details are of that proposal yet. We're very  
13 interested in seeing the details, there are lots of  
14 issues with it, and when we do examine it, we'll  
15 make a judgment as to whether it makes sense or not,  
16 whether it can be built, whether it's going to  
17 impact subway riders unnecessarily and so on.

18                   It's a very difficult thing, with all  
19 those subway lines in Lower Manhattan, to try to  
20 thread through an additional line in that system,  
21 and in particular, to try to construct it on the  
22 World Trade Center site where you have PATHs coming  
23 in from the west and you have the 1 and 9 and you  
24 have the N and R. So, you have these things, you  
25 have these lines in three dimensional space, and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 you're trying to stick a new line in there, and it  
3 remains to be seen whether it can be done.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Well, I guess  
5 that's what I meant by the need to explore  
6 alternatives to the direct extension.

7 MS. ZUPAN: Yes. The alternatives to  
8 it, as RPA has long -- not an alternative to it,  
9 because our proposal was out there long before this  
10 idea came out, was the idea of actually using the  
11 Second Avenue subway, which is going to be built  
12 down to Water Street, and the latest thinking of the  
13 MTA, and I can't speak for them, but in recent  
14 meetings earlier this week, they indicated they were  
15 leaning in favor of the Water Street alignment and  
16 building it in such a way that it could be extended  
17 to Brooklyn. And in my testimony I was alluding to  
18 the fact that if that was done, that line could be  
19 extended out towards Kennedy Airport, connect at  
20 Jamaica, and then provide that direct access for  
21 Long Islanders, albeit not in the World Trade Center  
22 but at Second Avenue, and not do it by disrupting --  
23 or not do it in a way that may or may not be able to  
24 be built. The Second Avenue subway can be built on  
25 to Water Street and connect to Brooklyn.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: And, finally,  
3 I take it from your testimony, the proposed  
4 emergence of West Street and the extension of  
5 Greenwich Street to restore to the original grid  
6 block would meet the objectives you have outlined.

7 MR. ZUPAN: Yes, it would. Now, there  
8 may be other ways than burying West Street to  
9 accomplish that. Just because of the elevation  
10 changes. Burying West Street is expensive and if it  
11 could be done another way and accomplish the same  
12 objectives, that would be good.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Thank you, Mr.  
14 Chair.

15 MR. ZUPAN: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much.  
17 We have the Alliance for Downtown New  
18 York, Jill Oberlander.

19 Why don't we take three at a time, if  
20 that's okay.

21 We've also got Noah Budnick, from  
22 Transportation Alternatives.

23 And Carter Craft, from the  
24 Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance.

25 Let me just note that we have an

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 important hearing going on downstairs, so a number  
3 of the Committee members do need to get downstairs,  
4 but perhaps they can rejoin us in a bit.

5 Welcome.

6 MS. OBERLANDER: Thank you.

7 My name is Jill Oberlander, I'm  
8 General Counsel of the Alliance for Downtown New  
9 York, the district management association for the  
10 Downtown-Lower Manhattan Business Improvement  
11 District. We've been mentioned several times over  
12 the course of the day, so I'm sure you're all  
13 familiar with us.

14 I'm going to basically summarize my  
15 testimony, since much of what we have to say has  
16 been said by other people here as well, and we've  
17 testified prior, previously in other committees on  
18 similar types of things.

19 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Abbreviation would  
20 be most appreciated.

21 MS. OBERLANDER: Yes.

22 First is, we want to commend the  
23 efforts of the City, state and federal agencies for  
24 what they've done in the past four to six months in  
25 addressing the immediate transportation concerns,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 they responded very quickly and many measures have  
3 been put into place, and our community has been very  
4 grateful for that and we look to see more of that  
5 continue.

6                   Before September 11th, the Alliance  
7 convened a group of major downtown firms and  
8 organizations representing over 50,000 commuters  
9 commuting daily into Lower Manhattan. The goal was  
10 to try to identify the transportation needs of this  
11 community and overall their largest concern was  
12 access, transportation access to Lower Manhattan,  
13 both in the short and in the longer terms, and their  
14 position is that it's critical not only for employee  
15 retention, which we agree, but also to ensure that  
16 downtown remains one of the nations, remains the  
17 nation's financial center.

18                   In the longer term, I think when you  
19 look at the downtown district, it is the third  
20 largest business district in the nation, but it's  
21 served poorly by commuter rail and other kinds of  
22 transportation links. Direct rail, subway, bus, and  
23 waterborne transportation access are all -- as well  
24 as links in and among those modes, should all be  
25 included when you look at the redevelopment of

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 downtown are necessary components.

3                   Specifically, the events of September  
4 11th have given us a great opportunity to look at  
5 all of these issues. Many of the innovative  
6 approaches that were talked about today, subsidized  
7 ferry services, commuter rail, bus rapid transit  
8 lanes, other things, and we would urge the Council,  
9 the City, state, federal government, to re-examine  
10 all of these means and modes of transportation,  
11 right now is really the time. In the short term, as  
12 we have testified previously, destruction of PATH  
13 and the 1/9 service has had a real impact on access  
14 to downtown. There's been a great effort to increase  
15 ferry service for which we are very appreciative,  
16 but there are improvements that can be made right  
17 now, in terms of increased frequency, as well as  
18 improved land and waterborne transportation  
19 connections, and we would urge you to work and  
20 encourage that as well.

21                   As someone mentioned previously, we  
22 will be implementing the electric shuttle bus  
23 service later on this year, and that will serve to  
24 meet some of the need; however, some things can be  
25 done right now and we'd like to see that happen as

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 well.

3                   In conclusion, I think there's a  
4 consensus that downtown needs to stay the  
5 pre-eminent financial center, and we believe that  
6 this cannot occur unless there's a commitment to  
7 ensure commuter rail access to Lower Manhattan.

8                   We would be happy to work with you  
9 and with other members of the City, state and  
10 federal government to assist you in any means.

11                   Thanks.

12                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much  
13 for your comments.

14                   We have Noah Budnick from  
15 Transportation Alternatives.

16                   MR. BUDNICK: Chairman Liu, Council  
17 members, thank you for the opportunity to testify  
18 today. My name is Noah Budnick, I'm the Projects  
19 Director for Transportation Alternatives, the City's  
20 advocates for sensible transportation.

21                   We applaud the phenomenal efforts of  
22 MTA and NYC Transit, the Port Authority, the City  
23 Department of Transportation, to keep the City  
24 moving in the wake of the catastrophe of 9/11.

25                   These agencies have done outstanding

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 work that deserves all of our admiration and thanks.

3                   Let me start by saying my group  
4 strongly supports the 6:00 am to 10:00 am carpool  
5 rule. It is working to keep the City moving and has  
6 sharply reduced traffic congestion at the River  
7 crossings and within Manhattan by encouraging  
8 motorists to take transit and carpool.

9                   Attached to our testimony is our  
10 analysis of the carpool rule, which clearly shows  
11 that the rule has had no negative effect on  
12 commerce, and has likely helped business by making  
13 deliveries and critical services more accessible.

14                   The March 4th issue of Crains New  
15 York Business states, "Broadway has rebounded and  
16 sales are actually better than the same week one  
17 year ago."

18                   Crains adds that tourism in 2002 is  
19 projected to surpass 2001. The Council should  
20 support the carpool rule because it works.

21                   The Council should also support  
22 tolling the East River Bridges, both to reduce  
23 congestion, as the carpool rule has, and to raise  
24 revenue for badly needed bridge, road and Transit  
25 improvements.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Tolls are by far the most effective  
3 ways to address traffic congestion and fund bridge,  
4 road and transit improvements.

5 The following are specific  
6 recommendations for immediate Lower Manhattan  
7 pedestrian improvements:

8 First, the Transportation Committee  
9 should recommend to the Department of City Planning  
10 and the Department of Transportation that they  
11 convene a formal working group to devise major  
12 pedestrian and streetscape improvements in Lower  
13 Manhattan.

14 The Department of City Planning's  
15 1995 report on Downtown Pedestrian Improvements and  
16 extensive streetscape plans of the Downtown  
17 Alliance, are a very good place to begin.

18 One tool that DOT should put to use  
19 immediately, is sturdy, fixed, security bollards to  
20 replace the concrete barriers and planters blocking  
21 sidewalks and streets.

22 Likewise, the DOT should create  
23 secure areas and pedestrian zones with retractable  
24 bollards able to stop cars and trucks.

25 Attached is a two-page colored

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 pamphlet which shows how these bollards can be both  
3 attractive and functional.

4                   The Downtown Alliance has a detailed  
5 plan to install bollards on Lower Manhattan  
6 sidewalks to prevent sidewalk parking and to keep  
7 speeding vehicles off the sidewalks.

8                   Retractable bollards, controlled by  
9 E-ZPass style transponders raise and lower to allow  
10 authorized vehicles quick access to restricted  
11 areas.

12                   Retractable bollards are already in  
13 use at the entrance to City Hall's Park --

14                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: I'm sorry.  
15 What are you calling these? Retractable?

16                   MR. BUDNICK: Bollards.

17                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Bollards,  
18 okay.

19                   MR. BUDNICK: Yes.

20                   They are already in use at City  
21 Hall's parking lot, and are an ideal security  
22 solution for the Stock Exchange and Federal Reserve  
23 Bank, among other areas.

24                   As large swaths of Lower Manhattan  
25 streets are torn up to rebury electric and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 communication cables and to replace antiquated water  
3 and sewer lines, this is an ideal opportunity to  
4 create pedestrian friendly streets with curve  
5 extensions, raise crosswalks and other traffic  
6 calming measures.

7                   One opportunity that should be seized  
8 is to connect the World Trade Center site to the  
9 Lower Manhattan street grid, Battery Park City, the  
10 World Financial Center, and the waterfront with  
11 clearly delineated street level pedestrian paths.

12                   We join our colleagues at the  
13 Straphangers Campaign and civic groups in asking the  
14 Committee to urge the Mayor, MTA, Port Authority and  
15 the City and State DOTs to take four actions to  
16 improve bus, subway, and regional rail access to  
17 Lower Manhattan.

18                   1) Establish bus only lanes on West  
19 Street, Route 9A and in the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel  
20 when they reopen.

21                   Thousands of commuters would benefit  
22 from more reliable and faster bus travel to Lower  
23 and Midtown Manhattan, including those taking buses  
24 to and from Staten Island, New Jersey, Brooklyn and  
25 Upper Manhattan.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   The access to the current bus and  
3 emergency vehicle only use of Church Street near  
4 Ground Zero demonstrates the enormous potential of  
5 dedicated busways, which will also benefit  
6 motorists. These will provide more transit options  
7 and efficiently move people and reduce overall  
8 traffic.

9                   2) The MTA and Port Authority should  
10 build new convenient connections among downtown  
11 subway lines and the PATH system.

12                   A downtown grand central station,  
13 sensibly tying together the Nassau Fulton Subway  
14 complex and the PATH would be a boon to transit  
15 riders.

16                   3) The MTA should build a modern  
17 South Ferry terminus for the 1/9 line that allows  
18 more capacity and an easier connection to the  
19 ferries.

20                   4) The Port Authority and Battery  
21 Park City authority should construct West End  
22 access, which would allow subway and PATH riders to  
23 exit through a site at Battery Park City, such as  
24 the Wintergarden.

25                   We look forward to working with the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 City to make transportation in Lower Manhattan safer  
3 and more efficient.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much.

6 Carter Craft, from the Metropolitan  
7 Waterfront Alliance.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Carter, you  
9 get the prize for the best graphics.

10 MR. CARTER: Good afternoon. My name  
11 is Carter Craft. I'm the Program Director of the  
12 Metropolitan Waterfront Alliance. We're a  
13 region-wide network of more than 300 organizations.

14 There was a time when the waterfront  
15 was the heart of the City, when the sites and smells  
16 of commerce and transportation were part of  
17 everybody's daily life.

18 More recently, though, there was a  
19 time when the waterfront was a place most people  
20 avoided. Trucks and trains and boats were in  
21 constant motion, most of the buildings were  
22 warehouses or pier sheds, most people didn't even  
23 know that there was a waterfront, and in reality  
24 there is a lot of people that still don't.

25 Now we're awakening to the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 opportunity of the waterfront, our last frontier.

3                   If I can point you to your packet, on  
4 September 11th, really this frontier was almost a  
5 wall. This is a picture taken aboard the John Jay  
6 Harvey, a fireboat that was a retired fireboat  
7 called into service on that day. And there's an  
8 accompanying article from Soundings Magazine that  
9 talks about the rigid design of the Battery Park  
10 Seawall, and how the blocks of fixed iron fences  
11 hindered the evacuation of tens of thousands of  
12 people. When the rescue began, this fencing  
13 thwarted access for the tons of oxygen tanks, water,  
14 rescue equipment and everything that was brought in  
15 by water.

16                   We thank you for inviting us to  
17 testify, and what we now ask you to do is to help us  
18 to redesign our waterfronts themselves to be as  
19 intermodal as they can be - bollards, cleats, places  
20 for boats and barges to tie up are critical. There  
21 must be fewer fences, period. Less chain link and  
22 more access.

23                   Where fences are necessary, we're  
24 going to need gates and we're going to need openings  
25 for when we really need them.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Looking ahead, there are two  
3 opportunities, we see two opportunities that we  
4 really shouldn't miss.

5                   One is to create an enhanced  
6 intermodal commuter connections in Lower Manhattan,  
7 in order to reinvigorate the business district that  
8 drives the regions, as well as the nation's economy.  
9 In making water transit work you really need three  
10 things. This was part of some campaign literature I  
11 think we may have distributed to you over the summer  
12 and fall.

13                   But to make water transit work you  
14 need affordability. It's got to be priced so that  
15 everybody can afford it. Twelve dollar boatrides for  
16 those who can afford to pay isn't really fair, and  
17 when we subsidize everything from sidewalks to  
18 subways, we need to find middle ground so that ferry  
19 transportation gets its share of the pie.

20                   2) It's got to be connected. Once you  
21 get to the water's edge, that's exactly where you  
22 are, you're at the water's edge, either a bus or  
23 subway or rail or bike pedestrian connections have  
24 got to be made, upland connections.

25                   And third is critical mass. We need a

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 number of stops. We can't just continue to look at  
3 point-to-point service, we need to look at creating  
4 a critical mass of service. We didn't build the  
5 Number 6 train to go from Brooklyn, from the  
6 Brooklyn Bridge to Pelham Bay Park, we decided to  
7 make a number of stops to open up the communities in  
8 between. Ferry planning needs the same vision.

9                   The second opportunity is to seize  
10 this unexpected, unprecedented opportunity, really  
11 to make Lower Manhattan into an intermodal hub for  
12 harbor tourism and recreation.

13                   Also in your packets is a nice color  
14 drawing that really depicts the variety and the  
15 breath of cultural recreational tourist attractions  
16 all around the region.

17                   The plans of the Port Authority, on  
18 one hand, to build a \$40 million ferry terminal  
19 along the seawall outside the World Financial  
20 Center, have got to be re-examined in light of one  
21 proposal we learned about to convert North Cove  
22 itself into a ferry terminal. If some sort of change  
23 is to be made, we've got to find a way to  
24 accommodate the recreational and tour boats that are  
25 now at North Cove. They were there when we needed

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 them in September, and as the waters now get  
3 cleaner, we should be making more room for  
4 recreational excursion boating and sailing in the  
5 heart of the City and not less.

6           The opportunity, though, is not just  
7 to improve commuter access, but to bump up New  
8 York's tourism economy. You know, we've heard about  
9 13 million PATH train passengers a year who used to  
10 come to the World Financial Center, 37 million  
11 tourists come to New York City every year, including  
12 about 6 million who travel through Lower Manhattan  
13 to visit the Statue of Liberty and Ellis Island.  
14 According to the numbers given us by the Census  
15 Bureau and NYC and Company, New York's tourism  
16 sector is 280,000 person economy. Nearly one in  
17 three tourists in New York visit Lower Manhattan,  
18 and half of these take the boat to the Statue of  
19 Liberty and Ellis, the combined economic impact of  
20 these tours alone is \$4 billion. Tourist spending by  
21 ferry riders just visiting the Statue of Liberty and  
22 Ellis Island accounts for 45,000 jobs in New York  
23 City.

24           Despite the events of September 11th,  
25 visitation still rose to record levels in 2001. This

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 picture depicts what we call the Nation's Gateway.

3 It's really a network of waterfront cultural

4 attractions that we should market and grow together.

5                   On Upper New York Bay alone there are

6 more than 2 dozen recreational or cultural

7 facilities, from the Skyscraper museum just a few

8 blocks from here, to the Chinese Scholars' Garden at

9 Snug Harbor Cultural Center.

10                   But what do Empire Stores Fulton

11 Ferry State Park in Brooklyn, Ferry Point Park in

12 the Bronx, and Riis Beach on the Rockaway Peninsula

13 of Queens have in common? Well, they're all seeing

14 infusions of millions of dollars in public and

15 private capital, but none of them have ferry service

16 to connect them to each other or Lower Manhattan.

17                   The Department of Transportation

18 moves traffic, the MTA and the Port Authority move

19 commuters, but what agency in the City is enhancing

20 the mobility of tourists, one of the largest

21 contributors to the New York economy?

22                   Every summer about 25,000 New Yorkers

23 during June, July and August go to the beach by

24 ferry, but they go to beaches in New Jersey.

25                   We have five Parks Department and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 National Park Service beaches in New York City, but  
3 there's no ferry to the beach in New York.

4                   If we could get 50,000 people to go  
5 from Lower Manhattan by ferry to the waterfront  
6 attractions like the Bronx Zoo, the New York  
7 Botanical Garden, the Queens Botanical Garden, the  
8 Staten Island Botanical Garden, or Coney Island, we  
9 would create 400 additional jobs in every one of  
10 these neighborhoods, those are NYC accompanying  
11 numbers.

12                   If we created comparable water  
13 transit to our islands, City Island, Roosevelt  
14 Island, Brother Island, Randall's Island, Hoffman  
15 Island, Swinburne Island, Coney Island or Governors  
16 Island, or at any of the historic forts, Fort  
17 Totten, Fort Schuyler, Fort Jay, Fort Wadsworth, Fort  
18 Hamilton, Fort Tilden, Fort Washington or Fort  
19 Defiance, all together we'd create as many as 10,000  
20 more jobs, most of them in neighborhoods that have  
21 much higher unemployment than Lower Manhattan.

22                   If we make Lower Manhattan the hub of  
23 the harbor in this way, we can bring more than a  
24 million tourists who will use Lower Manhattan as  
25 their base of operations, filling up the hotels and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 restaurants and create a greater economic base that  
3 can bring neighborhood staples, grocery stores,  
4 theaters that now lag.

5                   These visitors will create an  
6 economic impact of nearly \$700 million a year while  
7 also making the necklace of waterfront cultural and  
8 recreational attractions more accessible to New  
9 Yorkers, too.

10                   So, looking ahead, we've got four  
11 recommendations:

12                   Number one is that North Cove and the  
13 World Financial Center water transit should be  
14 closely integrated with stairs, escalators,  
15 elevators, between the ferry landings and PATH and  
16 subway and bus transit, as well as the recreation  
17 and excursion boats.

18                   Number two, a Hudson River ferry line  
19 providing for direct access to Lower Manhattan to  
20 and from the World Financial Center should be  
21 implemented as soon as possible. Travel time is by  
22 water from Yonkers, for instance, or 24 minutes less  
23 than comparable time by train and subway.

24                   Number three, we should look down  
25 towards Pier 6. Covert the area possibly from Pier 6

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Heliport to the Coast Guard building, including the  
3 Battery Maritime Building and the White Hall Ferry  
4 Terminal into a unified super transit hub.  
5 Waterborne freight should be accommodated south of  
6 Pier 6, where access to the Heliport and the tunnels  
7 is direct.

8                   And fourth, from the Heliport north  
9 to Wall Street and the ferry pier number 11, we  
10 should look at maybe creating a recreational marina  
11 district, not just to necessarily accommodate boats  
12 that might, or if some people say might be displaced  
13 from North Cove, but really to allow recreational  
14 boating of all types, a larger presence, on the  
15 Lower Manhattan Waterfront.

16                   Lower Manhattan needs better water  
17 transit, and a better waterfront overall than the  
18 20th century left it.

19                   Thank you for the opportunity to  
20 participate in today's hearings, and I'm happy to  
21 answer any questions.

22                   Thanks.

23                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you. Do we  
24 have any questions for this panel?

25                   Thank you for taking your time out.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Let me call the next panel up. We  
3 have the Tristate Transportation Campaign.  
4 Straphangers Campaign, and the Atlantic Sail  
5 Charter. Sorry, let me correct myself. The New York  
6 Water Taxi, and we'll have the Atlantic Sail Charter  
7 in the next panel.

8                   On second thought, we will have  
9 Atlantic Sail Charter come up now.

10                   Thank you, Lisa Schreibman, for  
11 joining us from the Tristate Transportation  
12 Campaign.

13                   MS. SCHREIBMAN: Thank you for having  
14 me this afternoon.

15                   The transportation infrastructure and  
16 management programs in Lower Manhattan must support  
17 the notion that this area is going to become a 24/7  
18 neighborhood. It should be rebuilt to decrease the  
19 conflicts that presently exist and existed before  
20 September 11th, between the residential and business  
21 communities, and improve the area's transportation  
22 links to other areas of the City and the region.

23                   However, it must also recognize that  
24 the area has severe space limitation, and take into  
25 account that many other areas of the City also have

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 pressing transportation infrastructure needs. So,  
3 what follows are three basic goals: To improve  
4 transit, improve delivery efficiency and improve the  
5 pedestrian environment, and under each the Tri-State  
6 Transportation Campaign would like to suggest a  
7 series of both physical and regulatory steps that  
8 could be taken to achieve the goal.

9                   Prior to September 11th, 95 percent  
10 of the people who entered Lower Manhattan during the  
11 rush hour did so by transit, on bikes or in  
12 carpools. Yet, traffic congestion on streets delayed  
13 drivers, buses and deliveries.

14                   To ease the congestion and consequent  
15 air pollution, more needs to be done to promote both  
16 transit and pedestrian travel.

17                   First, the Second Avenue subway, as  
18 presently proposed, has the potential to increase  
19 Lower Manhattan's connections to the east side of  
20 Manhattan, and those served by MetroNorth Railroad.

21                   People in East Harlem, the Upper East  
22 Side, Tudor City, Stuyvesant Town, the East Village  
23 and Lower East Side now all have a long walk to the  
24 Lexington Avenue subway, and once there, face the  
25 most crowded conditions of commuters during the rush

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 hour. Building the Second Avenue subway would both  
3 create more convenient connections for these people,  
4 as well as decrease rush hour crush. As such, it  
5 could decrease use of the Lexington Avenue line and  
6 encourage more people to use MetroNorth Railroad.

7                   However, the Second Avenue subway  
8 could also provide better connections to Brooklyn  
9 and the Bronx, and plans to extend it to Brooklyn  
10 along one of the existing subway routes, or in a new  
11 tunnel, or in the Bronx a new alignment should be  
12 seriously considered.

13                   The connection between Battery Park  
14 City and the PATH/subway must be improved. And I was  
15 happy to hear that the Port Authority is indeed  
16 moving forward in creating those connections. But  
17 those connections must not only be the physical  
18 connection, but also from a regulatory point of  
19 view, they have to be the payment method.

20                   If anyone else's wallet looks like  
21 mine, having to carry just one more card could be  
22 the difference between getting home at night and  
23 not. And to the extent that the PATH and the subway  
24 are using entirely different payment systems and  
25 could, you know, fairly easily be connected, we need

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 to, you know, make sure that the Port Authority and  
3 the MTA are moving towards a one-payment system, and  
4 preferably one that has some sort of free transfer  
5 between the systems.

6                   The South Ferry station must be  
7 lengthened. Presently, as many people know, only  
8 five of the 1 and 9 subway cars make it to the  
9 platform, and as a result, there are train delays as  
10 passengers make their way from the back of the train  
11 to the front. Imagine your worst nightmare, in a  
12 foreign country you spoke the language least well in  
13 and now have that come over the subway announcement  
14 system, and now try to get to the front of the car  
15 without getting lost, and you'll have some idea what  
16 people going to the Statue of Liberty and the other  
17 attractions in Lower Manhattan face when they get  
18 off at South Ferry and can't get off at South Ferry.

19                   The rebuilt subway station really  
20 needs to be integrated into the City Department of  
21 Transportation's new ferry terminal that they are  
22 presently building.

23                   A Long Island Railroad connection  
24 would be nice, but it must not deter subway riders  
25 or defer other transproposals that have been

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 developed. Passengers on Long Island Railroad  
3 presently use a subway to access Lower Manhattan, as  
4 do the passengers on MetroNorth Railroad and New  
5 Jersey Transit, and schemes to create a one-seat  
6 ride via new tunnel from Brooklyn should be weighed  
7 against other multi-billion dollar projects.

8                   But plans to take over the A and C  
9 tunnel which serves 110,000 subway riders so that  
10 approximately 10,000 Long Island Railroad riders  
11 could have this one-seat ride, is certainly  
12 counterproductive.

13                   Bus rapid transit should be developed  
14 in Lower Manhattan. The bus rapid transit system has  
15 two integral parts. The first is some sort of bus  
16 lanes, and the second are technology improvements  
17 for buses.

18                   During weekdays there are 3,600 buses  
19 that enter Lower Manhattan. Prior to September 11th,  
20 these buses primarily used either West Street,  
21 Broadway/Trinity Place, Greenwich Church, Water  
22 Street and the FDR. Some or all of these streets  
23 must have bus lanes and the buses using the lanes  
24 should be equipped with technologies that prevent  
25 bunching, and delays, and such systems are being

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 used in LA and in San Diego and in dozens of cities  
3 across the country.

4                   The rush hour carpool rule that has  
5 been in effect since September 11th has done a good  
6 job of decreasing the number of cars coming into the  
7 central business district. It has encouraged  
8 carpooling and transit use, and as a short-term  
9 measure we support the rule; however, and we support  
10 it going on line for the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel  
11 once West Street is reopened, which as Commissioner  
12 Weinshall said earlier, could be as soon as April.

13                   However, carpool rules in general are  
14 sort of ham-handed - it treats all trips to all  
15 destinations at all times the same, and a more  
16 efficient way of decreasing congestion is through  
17 variable tolls.

18                   Tolls are presently collected on all  
19 Hudson River crossings and three of the seven East  
20 River crossings, and the other four must be told  
21 using barrier-free technologies.

22                   Barrier-free technologies presently  
23 in place in California prevent you from having to  
24 stop and pay a fee, preventing back-ups into the  
25 communities that were most affected on the Brooklyn

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 and Queens sides of the bridges.

3                   The next set of comments is about  
4 increasing delivery efficiency and decreasing the  
5 conflicts between deliveries and residents.

6                   Many conflicts that exist between the  
7 residents and businesses arise over when trucks make  
8 deliveries, and these clashes could be decreased  
9 through prioritizing street space by time of day and  
10 use. After transit, the best use of street space  
11 during working hours is for deliveries, except near  
12 schools and hospitals.

13                   Regulations that prioritize both  
14 street and parking space for trucks should encourage  
15 deliveries to be made at the times that do not  
16 disturb people at night. For instance, regulations  
17 might ban cars from entering certain streets during  
18 certain hours to ensure deliveries can be made.

19                   Further parking regulations must  
20 encourage trucks to load and unload quickly so that  
21 they do not inhibit each other.

22                   In midtown, on-street parking fees  
23 increase at an increasing rate, with the quantity of  
24 time a truck spends parked, thus discouraging  
25 loitering.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   Finally, improving the pedestrian  
3 environment is really essential to keeping Lower  
4 Manhattan alive. We cannot expect tourists to return  
5 if it looks like a war zone for much longer.

6                   Prior to September 11th, the  
7 conditions were not terribly great either.  
8 Pedestrian experience in Lower Manhattan was, you  
9 know, widely varied, along with the Hudson River  
10 where the State had developed a promenade, and on  
11 Fulton Street, east of Water Street, you know,  
12 pedestrians had exclusive use of the street space,  
13 and the reasons, either recreational or commercial  
14 to gather.

15                   On the other hand, crossing west  
16 street posed significant hazards, and many streets  
17 seemed to be permanently clogged.

18                   The design of the World Trade Center  
19 site must -- the design of the original World Trade  
20 Center site destroyed the street grid of Lower  
21 Manhattan, Greenwich, Cortlandt, Dey were severed  
22 and buildings plopped onto their roadbeds. When the  
23 site is redeveloped, the streets need to be restored  
24 at least for pedestrians.

25                   Permanent aesthetically pleasing

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 safety and construction equipment should replace the  
3 temporary barriers that have been strewn throughout  
4 lower Manhattan. For instance, due to the terrorist  
5 attacks, Jersey barriers are being used to increase  
6 security around dozens of buildings creating an ugly  
7 and potentially frightening pedestrian environment.  
8 These should be replaced with bollards that would  
9 serve the same safety function but not be unseemly.  
10 Finally, retail economic development  
11 efforts should concentrate on street-level  
12 businesses. People and stores attract each other.  
13 Hiding either in underground concourses decreases  
14 sidewalk activity and should be avoided.

15 I want to thank the Chairman, or the  
16 Chairmen, for inviting us today. Thank you very  
17 much.

18 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you.

19 We have now Brendan Sexton from New  
20 York Water Taxi and the Durst Organization.

21 MR. SEXTON: Yes, thank you very much,  
22 Mr. Chairman, and Mr. Chairman. Thanks for having  
23 me. Even after all this testimony today, I think I  
24 will be able to say something that you haven't  
25 already heard, and I'll try to avoid saying, I'll

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 skip over anything you might have already heard, we  
3 are trying to respond with New York Water Taxi to  
4 one of the severest difficulties Lower Manhattan had  
5 even before September 11th, which, of course, is  
6 getting around.

7                   Since September 11th, getting around  
8 downtown has turned out to be even more difficult  
9 than could have been imagined. In fact, no one would  
10 have imagined it.

11                   I think most people, including these  
12 two committees, are addressing it responsibly, and  
13 in addition to the other fine ideas you've heard  
14 today, including moving and linking the PATH  
15 station, I think yesterday deserves terrific credit  
16 for focusing on a previously unappreciated  
17 transportation asset, even an advantage to be had in  
18 Lower Manhattan, that is the water.

19                   Manhattan is narrowed downtown. No  
20 place is more than few blocks from the water. The  
21 water is the secret advantage for downtown, secret  
22 only because of course we've been hiding it from  
23 ourselves.

24                   Meanwhile, under our radar, our  
25 wonderful ferry industry and system has grown up

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 crossing the rivers each day.

3                   However, there is a remaining gap  
4 which is filling in the niches in the harbor once  
5 you get across, and the Water Taxi and in addition  
6 to my testimony, you should also have gotten a  
7 package, showing our lovely little boat, and our  
8 routes, and expanding some of our service, with our  
9 first two boats in construction right now, they are  
10 about half built in Westchester, at Director Ship  
11 Yard, it is a smaller, faster, more maneuverable  
12 hop-on hop-off version of the larger ferries now in  
13 the water. It seats 54 persons, it goes 24 knots,  
14 and will run commuter routes focused on Lower  
15 Manhattan, from Fulton Ferry Landing in Brooklyn to  
16 Pier 11 with the seaport on the East River, Hudson  
17 Historic Battery Park and around to Battery Park  
18 City on the Hudson, and, of course, back again.

19                   The boats are especially designed to  
20 be low weight, low emission, fully accessible,  
21 environmentally friendly, good neighbors. This is  
22 assured by the Durst Organization's commitment to  
23 green investment and by the history and philosophy  
24 of the Water Taxi's inventor, Tom Fox.

25                   Tom, I think most of you know, or

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 many of you will know, was the first head of the  
3 Hudson River Park, and his history is as a park  
4 builder and an environmentalist.

5                   This combination has produced a  
6 superb boat which needs no parking lots, no upland  
7 infrastructure, can dock at a simple barge held by  
8 our piles, can co-exist with parkland, kayakers, and  
9 other public users.

10                   During non-rush hours the boats will  
11 operate as tour and travel service bringing people  
12 not only to and from Midtown but to tours and spots  
13 along the Hudson, the East River and elsewhere in  
14 the Harbor. In fact, we think we're the perfect boat  
15 for the harbor loop proposed by the Metropolitan  
16 Waterfront Alliance, from whom you just heard.

17                   In the evening, the boats will be  
18 available for Charter. These services will be a  
19 great amenity for New York City, but we hope  
20 valuable boats will be fully realized and serviced  
21 to the commuter runs, aiding the revitalization of  
22 Downtown.

23                   Our commuter service plans depend on  
24 getting a full fleet of three boats by this summer,  
25 and three more by next. We have not, I'm sorry to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 say, been able to find construction financing for  
3 the boats, it turns out to be very difficult to get  
4 target funding to build boats in America, in fact  
5 there are federal programs set up to help with this  
6 which we don't have time before summer to take  
7 advantage of.

8                   We have been asking the City and the  
9 state to help us with financing. We have a contract  
10 drop-dead date by March 15th, and it's possible we  
11 will get some help by then to get the full fleet,  
12 otherwise we will have to run the smaller service.

13                   I want to emphasize that we are not  
14 asking for subsidy to open and operate our company,  
15 the water taxi was originally conceived as serving  
16 primarily for tour and travel market, and it will  
17 make money serving only that market, at least we  
18 certainly expect and hope it will, but after  
19 September 11th we refocused the company on serving  
20 the business traveler, the commuter to Downtown, and  
21 it was this service which requires the full fleet.

22                   For commuter service, more boats,  
23 shorter headways, more stops and more reliability  
24 are needed, and this requires at least three boats  
25 this year and indeed the full six for full service.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   So, the Water Taxi will come to New  
3 York this summer, beginning July 4th, but whether it  
4 will turn out to be a link in a comprehensive  
5 water-based mass transit system serving Lower  
6 Manhattan is still an open question, I'm sorry to  
7 say. There is no mass transit service that survives  
8 without public support of some kind. Terminal  
9 construction, operating subsidy, tax-supported  
10 low-cost loans, or other. This includes the current  
11 ferry operators, they do in fact get subsidies, even  
12 if it's just public construction of that very, very  
13 expensive building called "the ferry terminal."

14                   The Water Taxi similarly can operate  
15 well and profitably, but to become part of a  
16 commuter mass transit system, probably some public  
17 support will be necessary, especially if we're to  
18 take a full fleet to downtown as we would like.

19                   If you look in your book, you will  
20 see that in our first year we wanted to emphasize  
21 our Lower Manhattan route, that's in blue, in the  
22 morning and evening rush hours, and then a larger,  
23 with more headways between boats, a larger  
24 tourist-oriented route up and down the river in the  
25 midday and evening, especially midday, which are the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 big tourist times, and in the second year with six  
3 boats, we can add stops in Brooklyn, at Greenpoint.

4 In addition to Fulton Ferry, we can go to  
5 Greenpoint, we can go to stops in the East River,  
6 such as 23rd Street, and more stops on the Hudson.

7                   New York is a city of islands, but we  
8 have spent the last two generations forgetting this,  
9 turning our backs on the water, considering it an  
10 obstacle to be bridged over, tunneled under, moved  
11 away from. We've forgotten that the water is  
12 essentially a free highway, that our City once was  
13 served by more than 100 ferry routes, that if we  
14 look at water as an advantage rather than a  
15 handicap, we turn out to be rich in transportation  
16 opportunities, and nowhere richer than in Downtown  
17 Manhattan where everybody is within a few hundred  
18 yards of the water.

19                   It is up to us to seize this  
20 opportunity. There is almost no simpler clearer step  
21 to be taken in getting downtown back up and  
22 flourishing.

23                   Either as a commuter service, or as a  
24 tour and travel amenity, or as both, New York Water  
25 Taxi will join the rebirth of New York Harbor this

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 summer, and we'll be adding a new environmentally  
3 friendly way to get around our town.

4                   We're proud of having come so far,  
5 and we hope to treat you all to a getting to know  
6 you cruise on the boats this summer.

7                   Thank you.

8                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you for your  
9 comments.

10                   We have Patrick Harris from Atlantic  
11 Sail Charter.

12                   Welcome.

13                   MR. HARRIS: Thank you. Is this  
14 working?

15                   I'm really here as a sole proprietor,  
16 small business located at North Cove World Financial  
17 Center. I'm the captain and the owner of a charter  
18 sailboat that's been operating in the Harbor for 15  
19 years, the past ten years out of North Cove. And I'm  
20 very encouraged by some of the comments, but I'm  
21 also very concerned with the seeming rush to put  
22 ferries into North Cove exclusively.

23                   I'm a licensed Merchant Marine  
24 Captain, I've got a master's in this, and I know the  
25 field well, and I've been operating in this harbor

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 for 15 years, and I've seen what ferries do in a  
3 small basin, such as North Cove, and essentially it  
4 turns anything that's in there into a rubber duckie  
5 in a bathtub, and it's a displacement of essentially  
6 99 tons of water when the boats come in with no  
7 place to go. So, there's a lot of surge, people on  
8 the dock could fall down. I've seen the ferries have  
9 accidents, and I know that it's a liability in a  
10 very small place, and it will cause other operations  
11 there to cease. Prudent seamanship would dictate  
12 nothing else.

13 I was very concerned when I read the  
14 comments from Mr. Imperatore of New York Waterways  
15 Ferry, that said vessels such as his and  
16 recreational smaller vessels are not compatible. And  
17 he's got a point, they're really not. I really  
18 object on the basis of two grounds to have North  
19 Cove turned exclusively into a ferry terminal,  
20 safety and quality of life. I've touched upon the  
21 safety factors of it. Any engineer can tell you the  
22 same thing, anybody that's actually stood on the  
23 docks could tell you the same thing. Prior to the  
24 Water Taxi coming in, there was a predecessor to the  
25 Water Taxi that came in and they ran last year, and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 these boats are smaller, they're more agile, they  
3 displace less water and they are compatible. So,  
4 really, I'm advocating balance. I think that the  
5 idea of having -- I think there are half a dozen  
6 small boat operations out of North Cove, there's a  
7 water taxi operation, there are some larger charter  
8 boats, and outside on the seawall is Atlantic  
9 Facility, that's work very well for the past several  
10 years, and I understand there's a 40 million  
11 terminal to be planned and developed just a little  
12 north of that. These things worked well in the past,  
13 and they can work well in the future.

14                   In terms of the quality of life,  
15 there's been enough destruction downtown. I don't  
16 think we need to add more to it. And the plan by New  
17 York Waterways to facilitate their vessels entering  
18 and exiting the marina calls for a demolition of  
19 part of the seawall to expand the opening.

20                   I know from bringing in my own boat  
21 and several other boats for people, it's a very  
22 tricky operation. Under ideal conditions you go in  
23 and out like a car; however, the river can flow at  
24 two to three knots in October and the winds shift  
25 out of the north, it's every Captain's nightmare to

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 get in and out of there, because as you break  
3 through that opening, you've got say a 60 foot boat,  
4 you've got 30 feet with no water pressure on one  
5 side, and the back 30 has three miles an hour plus  
6 30 miles of wind twisting it in the other direction.  
7 Hence, the only way to come in there, you have to  
8 come in there hot. The ferries have hit their own  
9 docks and created some problems in the past. If  
10 they're coming in hot, in these little openings,  
11 it's a dangerous situation. I can tell you from  
12 firsthand experience.

13                   But the quality of life really is not  
14 to destroy that part of the seawall and open up that  
15 area, but I think to perpetuate some of the  
16 attraction that makes that area so beautiful.

17                   People walk down to just look at the  
18 boats sometimes, they like the sounds of the  
19 halyards tingling along the mass, it's a wonderful  
20 promenade. A ferry terminal is not necessarily a  
21 visual asset.

22                   It doesn't mean it can't be  
23 attractive, and it should be attractive, but it  
24 doesn't have that same charm.

25                   Another aspect is, if North Cove is

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 turned into a ferry terminal to the exclusion of  
3 operations like mine, the residential community down  
4 there, many of whom are my customers, on a Sunday  
5 afternoon for \$35 they can go sailing for three  
6 hours on an antique sailboat out to the Statue of  
7 Liberty. This is a nice thing. People have been  
8 doing it for years.

9                   Quality of life Downtown has been  
10 turned upside down, and I pledged to my landlord,  
11 I'm coming back, even though it's a construction  
12 site and there are some grave aspects to it, I'm  
13 going to be back there because I'm not going to say  
14 those people who flew those planes through the  
15 buildings turn my life upside down. I'm coming back  
16 and I'd like to see the City support efforts of  
17 individual entrepreneurs coming back in a positive  
18 manner.

19                   Thank you.

20                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much.

21                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Let me say,  
22 Captain, we appreciate your remarks. I don't know if  
23 you were here earlier when I questioned Commissioner  
24 Weinshall about the placement of ferry terminals --

25                   MR. HARRIS: Yes.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: And she stated  
3 on the record that before locating terminals in any  
4 site, she would work with and consult the inland  
5 communities, and I will work with you in the  
6 community to find an appropriate location for a  
7 ferry terminal downtown which I believe is not the  
8 North Cove.

9 MR. HARRIS: Thank you very much. I  
10 appreciate that.

11 MR. SEXTON: Am I allowed to make  
12 another comment? I just want to say that, the Water  
13 Taxi requires no terminals. We're glad to dock at a  
14 terminal if there is one, but all we need is a barge  
15 and four spuds, and we don't need North Cove turned  
16 into a ferry terminal for our purposes, thank you.  
17 And it's a wonderful place, North Cove. It sure is.

18 CHAIRPERSON LIU: We appreciate your  
19 comments today. Let me just say that, quality of  
20 life for the folks who live in Lower Manhattan and  
21 the folks who provide certain amenities to people  
22 who not only live in the Lower Manhattan area, but  
23 all throughout the region, those are things I think  
24 we want to protect.

25 At the same time, I think we do have

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 an opportunity here to create something that's on  
3 the scale or even greater than the scale of  
4 something like Grand Central or Penn Station, and  
5 what's unique about this side is the potential to  
6 link the waterways to the ground-based  
7 transportation, so I don't think that's something we  
8 should or want to overlook, but at the same time,  
9 there needs to be a balance.

10 MR. HARRIS: Great.

11 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you.

12 MR. HARRIS: Thank you.

13 MR. SEXTON: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Okay, we have our  
15 final panel, which would be George Haikalis, from  
16 Auto-Free New York, we've got a representative from  
17 Transportation Workers Union, Local 100, and the  
18 Permanent Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: As you  
20 approach the witness desk, to my friend George and  
21 the other witnesses, let me first thank you for your  
22 patience, and let me also add, don't be discouraged  
23 by the fact that other members had to go to another  
24 meeting. A transcript is being created, your remarks  
25 will be fully incorporated in the transcript and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 part of the official record and shared and  
3 disseminated to the committees and the Council at  
4 large, and duly heeded and noted and studied. So, we  
5 thank you for your patience and congratulate you.

6 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Press the button so  
7 that the light is off.

8 MR. HAIKALIS: I think the last time I  
9 spoke here was when the air train hearing was going  
10 on, I don't know if I want to remind John about  
11 that, but congratulations to both of you and the  
12 other members of the Council for hosting this  
13 hearing.

14 I won't try to emulate or compete  
15 with the graphics that Carter Craft did, but my  
16 testimony is largely one graphic. I hope you have a  
17 copy of it in front of you. This map -- well, let me  
18 just start by saying my name is George Haikalis, I'm  
19 a civil engineer and transportation planner, I  
20 worked for 19 years with the Tri-State Regional  
21 Planning Commission when we had a Planning  
22 Commission that dealt with all three states, I  
23 worked for nine of those years in the World Trade  
24 Center on the 82nd Floor, and I was, like many  
25 others, saw my place of work disappear on 9/11,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 former place of work. This map was made in the World  
3 Trade Center on the 82nd Floor in 1974. It shows how  
4 long it takes for ideas to percolate in the system.

5                   This was an idea to make a grid of  
6 pedestrian streets in Lower Manhattan with a ring  
7 road around the periphery, much like cities in  
8 Europe in 1974 were doing. Our Lower Manhattan area  
9 is kind of like a European Helter Skelter street  
10 system, the midtown grid.

11                   I won't go into the detail of  
12 explaining it. I'm delighted to come in and talk to  
13 you or your staff about that.

14                   The new feature that's on this map is  
15 a light rail loop, and this was added recently.  
16 Light rail is a modern version of street cars. I  
17 would be happy to lead a delegation of the City  
18 Council across the river to see the light rail  
19 system in Jersey City, which has been a tremendous  
20 success, a delight to use and it's the kind of thing  
21 that's been done in every City across the country,  
22 24 cities, even Salt Lake City had it, although they  
23 didn't show much of it during the Olympics, but it  
24 was a core of their transportation system, a loop  
25 that would serve as a distributor for the ferries

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 and for the PATH and for people to get around from  
3 one side of Lower Manhattan to the other.

4                   These two elements, the grid of  
5 pedestrian streets, and the light rail loop, would  
6 completely transform Lower Manhattan, and the thing  
7 is this is affordable. This is the kind of thing  
8 that we could do sooner than later. As we reopen  
9 streets, we can reopen them in the way that makes  
10 them attractive, we can take out barriers to keep  
11 terrorists out, and make them instead pleasant  
12 attractive pedestrian only spaces.

13                   If we do this by thinking, we need  
14 vehicles, and where we need pedestrians.

15                   We need to also move away from a kind  
16 of an autocentric Lower Manhattan. We don't need to  
17 put the 3,000 cars back in the World Trade Center  
18 garage. That was a terrible mistake, as we learned  
19 seven or eight years ago.

20                   I want to say something about  
21 regional rail, because there's been a lot of talk  
22 about it, and I didn't want to spend a lot of time  
23 today on it, I would like to come in and talk to  
24 your staffs about it.

25                   In your district, Councilman Liu, the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Port Washington line of the Long Island Railroad  
3 runs through there, as infrequent service, very high  
4 fares, and it hardly serves anyone in the local  
5 area.

6                   In Berlin, or in Paris, or even in  
7 London, the commuter rail system operates as a  
8 regional rail system. It's fully integrated, the  
9 fares, you take your MetroCard and you get right on  
10 the train, if you're going to the Penn Station area,  
11 that's the quickest way to get to where you want to  
12 go. Instead of piling everybody up on the subways,  
13 you let people choose their optimal route within the  
14 City.

15                   Commuter rail system doesn't belong  
16 to the folks in Nassau and Westchester, it belongs  
17 to all of us, City and suburbs. And therein lies the  
18 secret to getting access to Lower Manhattan from the  
19 suburbs, not just from Lower Manhattan, it's from  
20 the outer parts of the City, as well. By converting  
21 our commuter rail system, our sleeping giant of  
22 mobility, into a true regional rail system modeled  
23 after the S Bahn or the RAR or whatever, even to  
24 some extent modeled after the Washington Metro or  
25 the Bart system, which serves the suburbs and the

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 City, we can completely transform our mobility, take  
3 advantage of what we have. To get this into Lower  
4 Manhattan, a few crucial links will have to be  
5 built, but this is where there is some sympathy  
6 nationwide if we come up with a -- if we could  
7 fashion a plan together.

8                   It's been very tough. Every rail buff  
9 has his plan, as you know from the efforts in Queens  
10 for the airport, some people want a train, some  
11 people don't and so forth, it's not going to be  
12 easy, but in Lower Manhattan I think the compelling  
13 need is to make access work from the suburbs and  
14 from the outer parts of the City and from Staten  
15 Island as well.

16                   And this can be done if we think  
17 about this as a family. I've got some ideas on this.  
18 I didn't want to get into them today because of the  
19 length of the time and the hearing, but I'd like to  
20 come in and discuss them with the staff.

21                   So, both of you gentlemen, I wish you  
22 well, and thanks again.

23                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you, George.  
24 Good to see you.

25                   We have Katherine Brower.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 MS. BROWER: Yes. I appreciate the  
3 opportunity to come and testify for the Committee  
4 this afternoon.

5 My name is Katherine Brower, and I am  
6 the Associate Director of the Permanent Citizens  
7 Advisory Committee to the Metropolitan  
8 Transportation Authority. And I'm pleased to present  
9 testimony on behalf of Executive Director Beverly  
10 Dolinsky.

11 The PCAC is the umbrella organization  
12 for the three independent legislative mandated  
13 councils created by the New York State Legislature  
14 in 1981 to represent the interests of riders on the  
15 Long Island railroad, MetroNorth railroad and New  
16 York City Transit.

17 The PCAC wants to acknowledge and  
18 thank the employees of the MTA and it's operating  
19 agencies, the New York City Transit, MetroNorth  
20 Railroad, and Long Island Railroad for their bravery  
21 and commitment on September 11th and the days  
22 following.

23 We also want to thank and acknowledge  
24 the MTA and the Port Authority for their commitment  
25 to rebuilding as quickly as possible, even faster

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 than was originally thought feasible.

3                   Additional thanks go to the New York  
4 City Department of Transportation for the many  
5 initiatives used to improve traffic flow.

6                   September 11th affected the economy  
7 of this region and beyond. The efficient movement of  
8 workers and consumers is an important element to the  
9 revitalization effort of the New York economy and  
10 the region.

11                   In this regard, efforts must be made  
12 to ensure that New York City receives its fair share  
13 of federal monies for rebuilding the transportation  
14 system.

15                   There is no doubt that transportation  
16 is key to the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. To  
17 this end, we suggest a number of short and long-term  
18 actions that must be taken to assist in the rapid  
19 recovery of the downtown area.

20                   The 1/9 and PATH rebuilding.  
21 Rebuilding the 1/9 line, the Cortlandt Street  
22 Station and the PATH system are the most pressing  
23 needs. Both the MTA and the Port Authority have  
24 recognized these needs and are moving forward with a  
25 concerted effort to rebuild the 1/9 line and PATH as

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 soon as possible.

3                   We recommend that a diamond switch be  
4 constructed south of Chambers Street on the IRT  
5 Seventh Avenue line local tracks, to provide the  
6 redundancy and flexibility --

7                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Just for the  
8 record, what is a diamond switch?

9                   MS. BROWER: It's a diamond-shaped  
10 switch that allows trains to switch from one track  
11 to another.

12                   It was really essential on 9/11 to  
13 allow the trains to switch tracks in an emergency.

14                   We also recommend that the  
15 long-needed improvements South Ferry be undertaken  
16 while the 1/9 is being reconstructed.

17                   It is better to improve the station  
18 now while work is underway than to wait for some  
19 time in the future.

20                   The rebuilding of PATH and the 1/9  
21 Cortlandt Street Station should be used as an  
22 opportunity for connecting all of the services in  
23 that area, through an underground connection from  
24 the World Financial Center, east to the Seventh  
25 Avenue IRT at Williams Street.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                                 This connection would serve the 1, 2,  
3 3, 9, J, M, Z, A, C, E, 4, 5 and PATH trains. Other  
4 long-term opportunities include moving the 1/9  
5 closer to Battery Park City and the World Financial  
6 Center, and building an enclosed transfer for the  
7 many ferries that serve this area.

8                                 In fact, I'm heartened to say that  
9 this afternoon we heard from MTA Chairman Peter  
10 Calico that if approved he would commit a portion of  
11 the \$1 million grant the MTA is due to receive from  
12 the federal government for projects directly related  
13 to Downtown Lower Manhattan to improving the South  
14 Ferry Station and to an intermodal facility.

15                                 The PATH system plays an important  
16 role within the regional economy. The system  
17 transports approximately 120,000 people daily, of  
18 which ten percent to 12 percent are reverse  
19 commuters.

20                                 At present, the Port Authority  
21 estimates that the restoration of PATH service to  
22 Lower Manhattan will take between 18 to 24 months to  
23 complete. Recognizing the strategic economic role  
24 played by the PATH system, we hope a temporary  
25 station can be operational as soon as possible.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2                   We want to stress the importance of  
3 monitoring the PATH rebuilding in order to ensure  
4 that it's up and running as soon as possible.

5                   We also recommend that the  
6 decision-making process be carried out as openly as  
7 possible.

8                   Our next recommendation is staged  
9 integration. In the quest to increase efficiencies  
10 in rider connectivity between New York City Transit  
11 and other carriers, we strongly support the proposal  
12 that the MetroCard be seamlessly extended to the  
13 PATH system via technology sharing, and I think  
14 you've heard a lot about that this afternoon.

15                   The integration should be carried out  
16 in incremental stages. Phase I would include the use  
17 of the MetroCard for PATH, while Phase II would  
18 combine New Jersey Transit monthly bus and commuter  
19 rail, as well as other regional carriers.

20                   Improved bus movement. There must be  
21 a provision to move buses more efficiently through  
22 Lower Manhattan with improved east/west connecting  
23 streets, river to river where possible.

24                   In the absence of two-way streets,  
25 paired one-way streets should be designated.

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 Rebuilding downtown should include  
3 bus lanes and other traffic management initiatives  
4 to improve bus movement.

5 Pedestrian and bicycle improvements.  
6 Wherever new connections are made, wide sidewalks  
7 should be provided for improved pedestrian flow, a  
8 downtown imperative.

9 In addition, plans under discussion  
10 to continue the West Street 9A bike path around the  
11 Battery and up to the east side should be  
12 implemented.

13 In order to accomplish these  
14 recommendations, coordination and cooperation among  
15 the New York City Department of Transportation, MTA,  
16 Port Authority, Downtown Alliance and New Jersey is  
17 essential.

18 This is an opportunity to think  
19 regionally and to better meet the needs of riders  
20 who come from both states.

21 Money from the current capital  
22 program should not be diverted to meet these needs.  
23 These are exceptional circumstances, and the funds  
24 to rebuild and improve the system that was destroyed  
25 on 9/11 must be separate from those funds that are

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 required to maintain and restore our transportation  
3 system on an annual basis.

4 Insurance will only pay to rebuild  
5 in-kind. FEMA may provide some money for  
6 improvements, but we should plan outside the box and  
7 use this tragedy as an opportunity to make needed  
8 transportation improvements in Lower Manhattan.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much  
11 for your comments. I think that -- oh, I apologize,  
12 I did not see you. Jimmy Willis from TWU, Local 100.

13 MR. WILLIS: Thank you. I'm here as a  
14 representative of the Transport Workers Union, Local  
15 100. I would like to thank the chairs and Committee  
16 members for the opportunity to present Local 100's  
17 multi-point plan in response to our current crisis.

18 TWU, Local 100, representing the men  
19 and women who work for New York City Transit,  
20 MAPSTOA, and many private lines bus carriers, has  
21 issued a six-point plan to keep New York moving in  
22 the wake of the crisis caused by the World Trade  
23 Center disaster.

24 Our plan calls upon the City to:

25 - increase service on existing bus

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 and subway routes, and add to our existing bus fleet  
3 through lease or rental of additional buses.

4 - establish new express bus routes to  
5 relieve congestion on subway lines.

6 - implement bus only lanes on major  
7 bridges and tunnels, as well as on major Manhattan  
8 cross streets and avenues.

9 - set up peak period bus lanes on  
10 expressways.

11 - encourage more employers to offer  
12 TransitChek.

13 - give buses traffic enforcement  
14 cameras, as the City of London has done, which can  
15 issue tickets to cars and trucks blocking bus stops  
16 and bus lanes.

17 - rail transit should be expanded.

18 - plans for a Second Avenue subway  
19 should be moved forward, including a Brooklyn  
20 connection.

21 - plans for PATH train extension to  
22 the Fulton Street Station should be encouraged.

23 - a new effort must be made to seek  
24 funding for these mass transit improvements,  
25 recognizing that mass transit is a powerful engine

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 to drive our economy and it is a great leveler,  
3 bringing economic, educational and health care  
4 opportunities to all New Yorkers.

5                   We have one of the greatest natural  
6 harbors in the world. We need to utilize it.

7                   - ferry service coupled with shuttle  
8 buses to move commuters into the heart of the City  
9 is imperative.

10                  - finally, our Local 100 is in favor  
11 of continuing the one driver occupancy ban currently  
12 in effect.

13                  - Manhattan curb space should be used  
14 smartly to speed deliveries.

15                  - we support charging variable fees  
16 for on-street parking south of 60th Street.

17                  - corner spaces in Midtown should be  
18 reserved for taxi stands.

19                  - alternatives to motor vehicle  
20 travel should be aggressively promoted, including  
21 foot and bicycle access.

22                  This means widening sidewalks and  
23 congested areas, and providing secure bicycle  
24 parking near major bus and subway stops.

25                  Local 100's history and tradition is

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 about securing decent wages, respect and dignity for  
3 the men and women who move New York.

4                   It is also about standing up for  
5 civil rights, and for the poor and disenfranchised.

6                   We hold high the obligation of  
7 society to guarantee the right to economic  
8 opportunity for all. Investment in our public  
9 transportation infrastructure is an investment in  
10 the future of our society.

11                   And these funds should be earmarked  
12 before tax incentives are given to private  
13 companies.

14                   Tax cuts, including the elimination  
15 of the commuter tax, threaten to make a fair  
16 increase more likely. This would disproportionately  
17 hurt a labor market that has been flooded with  
18 former welfare recipients and new immigrants. Before  
19 we raise fares we should also consider an income  
20 progressive tax on workers in Manhattan, including  
21 commuters, other possible funding sources, include  
22 congestion pricing, bridge and tunnel tolls, and  
23 restoration of the commuter tax.

24                   Additionally, I'd like to comment on  
25 two points. This past Tuesday's Lower Manhattan

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Development Corporation meeting, there was a  
3 representative there of the MTA who was asked what  
4 the MTA's plans were for the current crisis, and his  
5 answer in response was "check our website." Okay,  
6 that coupled with the fact that there is no MTA  
7 representative here today, I think is unfortunate,  
8 and, frankly, astounding. And I simply do not  
9 understand it.

10                   Once again I want to thank you for  
11 the opportunity to speak. I realize it's been a long  
12 day. And thank you for your patience.

13                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: Could you get  
14 us a copy of your ten-point plan?

15                   MR. WILLIS: Yes. I have it. I just  
16 didn't get it before. I have it here right now.

17                   CO-CHAIRPERSON GERSON: That would be  
18 great. Thank you.

19                   MR. WILLIS: Thanks.

20                   CHAIRPERSON LIU: Thank you very much.

21                   And let me just state that we do have  
22 written testimony submitted by the Lower Manhattan  
23 Development Corporation. If you would like a copy, I  
24 believe there will be copies available.

25                   Thank you. And I believe with that,

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 if there are no other speakers, our meeting is

3 adjourned. Thank you.

4 (The following written testimony was  
5 read into the record.)

6

7 Written Testimony Of:

8 Lou Tomson

9 President

10 Lower Manhattan Development Corporation

11

12 Testimony of Lower Manhattan Development Corporation

13 President Lou Tomson

14 New York City Council Transportation Committee

15 Thursday, March 7, 2002

16

17 The attack on the World Trade Center

18 had a severe impact on Lower Manhattan's

19 transportation infrastructure. It curtailed

20 vehicular access, disrupted subway and bus service

21 and exacerbated congestion.

22 The various city, state and federal

23 agencies working to address these problems have done

24 a tremendous job to restore service as quickly as

25 possible and to minimize the impact on residents and

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 visitors.

3                   For example, construction of a  
4 temporary pedestrian bridge over West Street is now  
5 underway to connect Battery Park City with the  
6 financial center, and a temporary roadway will allow  
7 for the reopening of Battery Park Tunnel in the near  
8 future.

9                   As we move forward with the process  
10 of revitalization, the challenge before us now is to  
11 address the shortcomings of Lower Manhattan's  
12 transportation infrastructure, not simply recreate  
13 it as it existed prior to September 11.

14                   West Street effectively erected a  
15 barrier between Battery Park and the rest of Lower  
16 Manhattan.

17                   The World Trade Center site disrupted  
18 the street grid, impeding east/west movement. And  
19 from a mass transit standpoint, midtown is certainly  
20 a more preferable work location for commuters from  
21 Long Island, Connecticut and Upstate new York  
22 compared to downtown, which requires making a  
23 connection at Penn or Grand Central stations.

24                   The Lower Manhattan Development  
25 Corporation believes that rebuilding and enhancing

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 the infrastructure in Lower Manhattan will be a  
3 central component of any redevelopment plan, if we  
4 are to succeed in creating a vibrant mixed use  
5 community.

6                   Since the issue of transportation is  
7 relevant to every constituency in Lower Manhattan,  
8 the subject transcends all of our Advisory Councils  
9 - the Residents Council has discussed the need to  
10 limit the number of instances the same road is dug  
11 up for construction work, while the Arts, Education  
12 and Tourism Council contemplated ways to make it  
13 easier for visitors to explore downtown's cultural  
14 treasures. But recognizing the centrality of this  
15 issue to the revitalization effort, the LMDC has  
16 created one specific Council to focus solely on  
17 transportation and commuters.

18                   The Advisory Councils are tasked with  
19 providing input to the LMDC on goals and objectives  
20 for each of their respective constituencies. The  
21 Transportation and Commuters Advisory Council is  
22 comprised of planning and civic organizations, small  
23 businesses, corporations, environmental  
24 organizations, transportation experts and residents.

25                   The Council met for the first time on

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 Tuesday, March 5. It was a very productive meeting,  
3 as members discussed a number of ideas for improving  
4 the transportation infrastructure, such as the  
5 desirability and feasibility of depressing West  
6 Street.

7                   The suggestions of the Advisory  
8 Council will help the LMDC craft its overall  
9 transportation objectives for the region.

10                   The LMDC is meeting regularly with  
11 officials from various agencies, such as the Port  
12 Authority, the MTA and the City and State  
13 Transportation Departments, to identify short term  
14 and long term ways to improve the transportation  
15 infrastructure.

16                   The LMDC is working closely with Con  
17 Edison to facilitate the building of a substation on  
18 Greenwich Street in a way that does not foreclose  
19 the possibility of reopening Greenwich Street  
20 pedestrian or vehicular traffic in the future. The  
21 LMDC is also considering ways to better exploit  
22 underutilized modes of transportation in downtown  
23 Manhattan, such as ferry service.

24                   As we coordinate the revitalization  
25 of Lower Manhattan, it's essential that the input

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 underlying this process is broad based.

3                   We look forward to working closely  
4 with the City Council - and this Committee in  
5 particular - to meet the transportation challenges  
6 in Lower Manhattan and explore the possibilities.

7                   Thank you for inviting us to submit  
8 this testimony today.

9

10

11 Written Testimony Of:

12 Senator Thomas K. Duane

13 27th Senatorial District - New York State Senate

14

15 Testimony of State Senator Thomas K. Duane before

16 the New York City Council Committees on

17 Transportation and Lower Manhattan Redevelopment on

18 the Reconstruction of Transportation Infrastructure

19 at and around the World Trade Center.

20 March 7, 2002.

21

22                   Good afternoon. I am State Senator

23 Tom Duane, representing the 27th State Senatorial

24 District in Manhattan, which includes the former

25 World Trade Center site. I am here to suggest a

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 number of issues that should be taken into account  
3 as planning for the reconstruction of the  
4 transportation infrastructure in Lower Manhattan  
5 goes forward.

6                   This is a critical moment for the  
7 history of New York City, as the decisions that are  
8 made now will have a profound impact on both the  
9 recovery of Lower Manhattan, and the extent to which  
10 the neighborhoods of Lower Manhattan will be  
11 accessible, pleasant places to live and work.

12                   I will focus my testimony on three  
13 key issues for the future of Lower Manhattan.

14                   First, I believe we must take  
15 advantage of this historic opportunity to improve  
16 integration of mass transit systems.

17                   As plans for reconstruction of the  
18 PATH station move forward, it must be coordinated  
19 with Metropolitan Transportation Authority plans for  
20 a transportation hub at Fulton Street, as well as  
21 with plans for the Second Avenue Subway.

22                   Ideally, all these transportation  
23 points should be linked in a way that ensures easy  
24 and convenient transfers between different lines.

25                   The reconstruction of transportation

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 infrastructure in Lower Manhattan should also ensure  
3 that every line is fully accessible, and that  
4 transfers between lines can be accomplished easily  
5 for people with disabilities. If these plans are  
6 effectively coordinated, we have the opportunity to  
7 greatly improve the organization of mass transit  
8 links to downtown Manhattan, which will both help  
9 encourage economic recovery and make the area a more  
10 convenient place to live and work.

11                 Second, plans for the reconstruction  
12 of transportation infrastructure in Lower Manhattan  
13 should focus on improving East-West links, and  
14 access to Battery Park City. Even before the tragic  
15 events of September 11th, Battery Park City was not  
16 adequately integrated into the rest of lower  
17 Manhattan by transportation and pedestrian links.

18                 Future plans should incorporate more  
19 bus service into Battery Park City, as well as focus  
20 on the development of more East-West routes for both  
21 vehicular and pedestrian traffic.

22                 Another important option for  
23 improving East-West transportation is increased  
24 ferry service, which can both link Lower Manhattan  
25 to other parts of the city, but can also serve a

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT

2 valuable role of linking locations on the Hudson  
3 with those on the East River, thereby making  
4 commuting across Lower Manhattan much easier.

5                   Finally, as we plan for the future of  
6 transportation in Lower Manhattan, it is essential  
7 to recognize that the limitations of the ancient  
8 street grid in this part of the City require that  
9 transportation solutions focus on encouraging mass  
10 transit, and recognition that lower Manhattan must  
11 be pedestrian friendly.

12                   Lower Manhattan can only support a  
13 limited amount of vehicular traffic before gridlock  
14 sets in, and while plans for Lower Manhattan should  
15 develop more efficient movement of vehicular  
16 traffic, they should focus primarily on ensuring  
17 that Lower Manhattan is conveniently accessible via  
18 mass transit, and that once in Lower Manhattan,  
19 people can easily and safely walk to their  
20 destinations.

21                   Increased mass transit links, such as  
22 the Second Avenue Subway and better ferry service  
23 are one example of steps that can help accomplish  
24 this goal.

25                   I thank the Council for holding this

1 TRANSPORTATION AND LOWER MANHATTAN REDEVELOPMENT  
2 hearing on transportation infrastructure for lower  
3 Manhattan. We must all act with vision at this  
4 critical moment for the future of New York City.

5 (Hearing concluded at 4:43 p.m.)

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATION

STATE OF NEW YORK )  
COUNTY OF NEW YORK )

I, CINDY MILLELOT, a Certified  
Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public in and for the  
State of New York, do hereby certify that the  
foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of the  
within proceeding.

I further certify that I am not  
related to any of the parties to this action by  
blood or marriage, and that I am in no way  
interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto  
set my hand this 7th day of March 2002.

-----  
CINDY MILLELOT, CSR.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, CINDY MILLELOT, a Certified Shorthand Reporter and a Notary Public in and for the State of New York, do hereby certify the aforesaid to be a true and accurate copy of the transcription of the audio tapes of this hearing.

-----  
CINDY MILLELOT, CSR.